

**GOVERNMENT OF THE SOCIALIST REPUBLIC OF VIETNAM
ASIAN DEVELOPMENT BANK**

MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING OF LOAN REVIEW MISSION

LOAN 2968-VIE: LOW CARBON AGRICULTURE SUPPORT PROJECT

22 – 28 April 2017

I. INTRODUCTION

1. On 12 December 2012, ADB approved the provision of a loan in the amount equivalent to SDR48,170,000 (US\$74 million equivalent) to the Socialist Republic of Viet Nam for the Low Carbon Agriculture Support Project (Project/LCASP). The Loan Agreement was signed on 7 March 2013 and became effective on 5 June 2013 with the closing date of 30 June 2019.

2. The expected impact of the Project is less agriculture-related pollution, as measured by better water quality due to reduced presence of livestock waste effluence. The expected outcome is greater uptake of climate-smart agricultural waste management practices (CSAWMP), as measured by increased use of clean biogas energy and organic bio-slurry fertilizers. To attain this outcome, the Project's original outputs are (i) expanded use of livestock waste management infrastructure; (ii) credit lines for biogas value chains (BVC); (iii) enhanced CSAWMP technology transfer and (iv) effective project management. Implementation of the various components and sub-components is being done through the executing agency (EA), the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD) represented by the Central Project Management Unit (CPMU) of the Agricultural Projects Management Board (APMB) and 12 implementing agencies (IAs) including provincial people's committees of the 10 participating provinces (Bac Giang, Ben Tre, Binh Dinh, Ha Tinh, Lao Cai, Nam Dinh, Phu Tho, Soc Trang, Son La, and Tien Giang) and 2 financial intermediaries (Vietnam Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development - VBARD and Co-operative of Vietnam - Co-opBank).

3. A Midterm Review (MTR) Mission was carried out from 12 to 30 September 2016, during which ADB and the Government agreed to some changes to the project including (i) to add the credit line scope in output 2 to "Credit Lines for Biogas Value Chains and other climate smart agriculture waste management investments"; and (ii) to include the Viet Nam Bank for Social Policies (VBSP) as a Financial Intermediaries under the Component 2 of the Project. Approval of the MTR mission recommendations by ADB were delayed considerably due to internal requirements to carry out additional due diligence on inclusion of the VBSP as an FI of the Project. ADB's approval of the MTR recommendations was communicated to the CPMU on 24 February 2017.

4. A Review Mission from the Asian Development Bank (ADB)¹ visited Viet Nam from 22 to 28 April 2017 to work with the Government to (i) review overall project implementation progress; (ii) review compliance of the loan covenants DMF updates; (iii) review implementation of the actions recommended by the last Midterm Review Mission; (iv) resolve the outstanding issues; (v) update the detailed implementation plan with projected schedules of contract awards and

¹ The Mission comprised Sanath Ranawana, Senior Natural Resources Economist (Mission Leader), Truong Thi Minh Hue, Associate Project Analyst, Do Thi Huyen, Consultant (Environment), Tran Thuy Hai, Consultant (Gender), and Pham Anh Tuyet, Consultant (Social Safeguards).

disbursements of ADB loans and provision of counterpart funds for all key activities of CPMU and PPMUs; and (vi) carry out field visit to building site of the selected subprojects.

5. The Mission met with the representatives of (i) the EA; (ii) 10 IAs of the participating provinces; (iii) other departments under MARD (International Cooperation Department; Department of Finance; Department of Livestock Production; Department of Cooperative and Department of Science, Technology and Environment). A list of persons met and those present at the wrap-up meeting is given in Appendix 1.

6. This Memorandum of Understanding of the Mission as discussed at the wrap-up meeting on 05 May 2017 summarizes the findings and agreed actions. The meeting was chaired by Mr. Chu Van Chuong, Deputy Director General of International Cooperation Department of MARD.

II. REVIEW OF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

A. Overall Progress

7. **Follow-up actions agreed upon during the mid-term review mission:** The agreed actions and status are presented in Table 1. Among 38 agreed follow-up actions, 22 actions are complete, 11 actions are on-going, 5 actions are in preparation or not yet done. However, among the actions that were completed the Mission noted the need for further refinement or clarification, as indicated in the last column of the table.

Table 1: Status of Agreed Follow-up Actions from the Previous Review Mission

No	Issue	Agreed Action	Time frame	Responsibility	Status/Remark
1	Output 1: Expanded Use of Livestock Waste Management Infrastructure	(i) CPMU to obtain realistic estimates of beneficiaries for the revised Incentives for Carbon Market Development (ICMD) from each PPMU and establish procedures for verification of eligibility. (Para 12)	December 2016	CPMU	Done; however PPMUs were unable to present the details to the clearly.
		(ii) Revise the eligibility criteria for ICMD for MBP (Para 13) and inform PPMUs of the decision to discontinue ICMD for LBP (Para 14).	March 2017	CPMU	Done; however PPMUs were unclear about how they would promote a comprehensive package of interventions to MBP operators.
		(iii) Develop links between beneficiaries supported under Output 1 and Output 3 (para 13)	March 2017	CPMU	Done Links developed to support for the additional procurement package of biogas generator. However further effort is needed for PPMUs to fully

No	Issue	Agreed Action	Time frame	Responsibility	Status/Remark
					understand the interlinkages between Outputs 1 and 3.
		(i) Support NBP's efforts to obtain CER credits for biogas plants supported under the Project (para 23)	Continuously implementing up to end of project	CPMU	On-going Meeting with SNV/BP to prepare the joint workplan
		(v) Procedures and templates for random checks of biogas plants to be revised to include environmental monitoring parameters and reports (Para 19)	March 2017	CPMU	On-going LIC is finalizing the draft version
2	Output 2: Credit Lines for Biogas Value Chains and other climate smart agriculture waste management investments	(i) Request SBV to undertake evaluation of VBSP's eligibility	October 2016	CPMU	Done
		(ii) Follow up with MOF's assessment of SBV's evaluation	November 2016	CPMU	On-going
		(iii) Project Agreement between ADB and VBSP	December 2016	ADB, VPSB	In preparation
		(iv) On-lending Agreement between MOF and VBSP	December 2016	MOF, VPSB	In preparation
		(v) Prepare a realistic sub loan implementation schedule for II and III quarters of 2017	March 2017	FIs	In preparation
3	Output 3: Enhanced Climate Smart Agricultural Waste Management Practices Technology Transfer	(i) No objection to Submission 0 of all research packages	September 2016	ADB	Done for Package 25-28 Package 29: Submitted 6th request for Submission 0 to ADB
		(ii) Award contracts for research packages	July 2017	CPMU and ADB	On-going Package 25: requesting for proposal Package 26: MARD approving Sub1 Package 27-28: ADB issued NOL to Submission 1
		(iii) Explain the benefits of participating in the demonstration activities	October 2016	CPMU, PPMU and LIC	Done

No	Issue	Agreed Action	Time frame	Responsibility	Status/Remark
		(iv) Update procurement plan to include revised demonstration packages in order to provide each demonstration site with a comprehensive set of interventions to ensure that they are good practice models of CSAWMP	November 2016	CPMU	Not yet Expected Update procurement plan after this mission
		(v) Update the training plan (and corresponding budget) to show clear rationale and links between research, demonstration and training activities.	October 2016	CPMU, LIC	Done
		(vi) Update the master training plan showing the rationale for training activities, links to the research and demonstration activities, identifying the target beneficiaries and the corresponding budget.	December 2016	CPMU	Done
4	Output 4: Effective Project Management	(i) Provide feedback on ADB's comments to the audit report and time-bound action plan	30 September 2016	CPMU, 2 FIs	Done
		(ii) Mobilize Biogas Value Chain physical audit consultant	June 2017	CPMU and ADB	On-going
		(iii) Upload Project baseline data in Project website	November 2016	CPMU	Done
		(iv) Assess the need to procure a project M&E software	November 2016	LIC	Done
		(v) Establish an M&E system using the baseline data	January 2017	LIC	Done
5	Environmental Safeguard Recommendations	(i) Improve quality of the environmental safeguards part in the next periodic project reports	January 2017	CPMU/ LIC	Done
		(ii) Internal monitoring report on environmental safeguards to be submitted to ADB on semi-annual basis	December 2016	CPMU/ LIC	Done
		(iii) Revise draft EMP with specific mitigation measures	November 2016	LIC	Done
		(iv) Appoint an environmental focal point at PPMU	November 2016	CPMU	Done
		(v) Establish an environmental management unit at CPMU	November 2016	CPMU	Done
		(vi) Conduct Rapid Environmental Assessment and environmental screening for MBPs and LBPs to avoid significant adverse environmental impact	December 2016	PPMU/LIC	On-going

No	Issue	Agreed Action	Time frame	Responsibility	Status/Remark
		(vii) Conduct IEE for B category MBP/LBP with specific EMP to mitigate the impacts	December 2016	PPMU/LIC	On-going
		(viii) Organize training for PPMUs on environmental safeguards	March 2017	CPMU/LIC	Not yet
6	EM Recommendations	(i) Mobilize gender and EM specialist under LIC to provide timely support to CPMU and PPMUs to implement the IPDP including monitoring and reporting activities;	October 2016	CPMU/LIC	Done
		(ii) Semi-annual internal monitoring report of IPDP implementation in 2016 shall be submitted to ADB to disclose on ADB website;	December 2016	CPMU/LIC	Done
		(iii) Strengthen project information dissemination at village and commune levels to get more involvement of EMs in project activities in 07 provinces (Son La, Bac Giang, Soc Trang, Lao Cai, Phu Tho and Ha Tinh)	Continuously implementing up to end of project	PPMUs	On-going
		(iv) CPMU and LIC reintroduce the requirements in IPDP to 07 provinces mentioned above (PPMU staffs, local authority and mass organization) to implement IPDP in their area.	December 2016	CPMU/LIC	Done
7	GAP recommendations	(i) CPMU and PPMUs conduct Gender awareness raising training and GAP briefing for key project staff (at least coordinator, gender focal, implementation, and technicians as part of the new training).	December 2016	CPMU, PPMUs	Done
		(ii) CPMU/PPMUs reintroduce the reporting requirements (template, tools for collecting sex and gender related data for reporting GAP and the DMF gender targets) and GAP reporting will be done quarterly as part of the project progress report to ADB.	December 2016	CPMU, PPMUs	Done
		(iii) PPMUs will actively outreach female participation in training courses (and as register of the project subsidies) and dissemination events, consultation, including to have separate consultation with women's only group through local women union' meeting to achieve the	Continuously implementing up to end of project	PPMUs	On-going

No	Issue	Agreed Action	Time frame	Responsibility	Status/Remark
		GAP targets (including those revised one after MTR).			
		(iv) LIC gender consultant will support closely PPMUs to implement and monitor and report GAP related targets.	October 2016	LIC, PPMUs	On-going
8	Review mission	Review mission	March 2017	ADB	Done

8. The Mission and CPMU estimated the Project overall physical progress as of 31 March 2017 to be at 17.35% (Appendix 2) based on weighted progress of project components in 66% of the loan period. Overall, the Project is making good progress in terms of meeting the original targets at the impact and outcome levels.


B. Progress of Project Implementation by Component

Output 1: Expanded Use of Livestock Waste Management Infrastructure

9. **Revised Targets after MTR.** The key performance indicators for this component are: (i) 65,000 SBPs, 40 MBPs and 2 LBPs and associated value chain infrastructure constructed and operating by June 2019. At least 5% of total SBPs will be constructed for ethnic minorities in project provinces; (ii) ICMD funds are fully channeled into at least 65,042 accounts of beneficiaries by June 2019; (iii) 65,000 SBP operators, 500 masons, 500 technicians, 28 engineers and 10 contractors trained by June 2019. At least 50% of trainees on biogas use will be women; 7% of trainees on SBP construction, and 20% of those trained on biogas management and technical issues will be women; and (iv) Single national biogas plant database managed effectively by 2017, including registration of both husband's and wife's names.

10. **Progress: Small-scale biogas plants (SBP).** As of 31 March 2017, 45,869 SBPs were constructed in which 3,135 SBPs were constructed for ethnic minorities in project provinces, accounting for 6.83%. ICMD funds (VND 3 million per beneficiary) were channeled to 41,962 accounts of beneficiaries. No SBPs have been supported under the additional target of 14,000 SBPs agreed during the MTR mission because the guidance to PPMUs on the increase in the ICMD amount and eligibility for selection of these beneficiaries was communicated to PPMU only on 12 April 2017.² The CPMU was unable to issue this guidance until the recommendations of the MTR mission were formally agreed by higher authorities of ADB and the Government.

11. **Findings.** The Mission visited households in Soc Trang and Son La provinces that had installed SBPs and noted that they have had a positive impact on the household's bio-physical environment as well as its socio-economic conditions. However, the following were observed: (i) the size of the constructed SBP in some cases was too small in comparison with the waste discharged, causing the overloading and anticipated mal-functioning SBPs. (ii) Some potential beneficiaries, especially the poor households, expressed interest to participate in both Component 1 and Component 2 of the Project as they did not have enough financial resources to contribute to the SBP construction; (iii) Some composite SBP suppliers did not provide maintenance in time when the SBPs were not functioning, causing dis-satisfaction amongst the beneficiaries. (iv) Some provinces (Bac Giang, Nam Dinh, Ha Tinh, Tien Giang) have nearly

² The ICMD would be increased to VND5 million per each beneficiary if that household meets at least one of the following criteria: (i) classified as a poor household or nearly-poor household as per Decision No. 59/2015/QĐ-TTg (dated 19 November 2015) promulgating the multidimensional poverty levels applicable during 2016-2020; (ii) the registered head of household is a female bread-winner, and (iii) belongs to an ethnic minority group. 

completed their targets of SBP construction with ICMD funds of VND 3 million; however they have limited target beneficiaries for inclusion under the revised criteria.

12. **Medium-scale biogas plants (MBP) and large-scale biogas plants (LBP).** By 31 March 2017, 8 MBPs³ in Phu Tho and Ha Tinh Provinces, and 2 LBPs⁴ in Nam Dinh Province were constructed of which ICMD funds were channeled to 6 beneficiaries. The Mission stressed that from 12 April 2017, in order to avail of the incentive of VND50 million, the MBP operators must commit to using all the gas produced by the plant and have the Rapid Environmental Assessment. However, several PPMUs seemed unclear about how they would encourage MBP operators to ensure complete utilization of biogas.

Table 2: Status of Biogas Construction by Province (as of 31 March 2017)

No	Provinces	Biogas Plants constructed							
		Small	Medium	Large	Total	Percent	Ethnic Minority	Percent	ICMD funds transferred
0	CPMU								
1	Lao Cai	2,314			2,314	5.0%	854	1.86%	2,067
2	Son La	1,879			1,879	4.1%	925	2.02%	1,849
3	Phu Tho	8,312	4		8,316	18.1%	115		6,573
4	Bac Giang	7,245			7,245	15.8%	394	0.86%	7,000
5	Nam Dinh	4,233		2	4,235	9.2%			4,102
6	Ha Tinh	4,843	4		4,847	10.6%			4,352
7	Binh Dinh	7,002			7,002	15.3%			6,668
8	Tien Giang	2,629			2,629	5.7%			2,488
9	Ben Tre	4,734			4,734	10.3%			4,395
10	Soc Trang	2,678			2,678	5.8%	847	1.85%	2,468
	Total	45,869	8	2	45,879	100%	3,135	6.83%	41,962

13. **Training on biogas plants:** The Project has trained 46,716 SBP operators (16,433 SBP operators are women, accounting for 35.20%), 375 masons (19 masons are women, accounting for 5.07%), 1,180 technicians (277 technicians are women, accounting for 23.47%), 28 engineers and 10 contractors. It has also produced (i) a guidebook on constructing/installing a SBP; (ii) a guidebook on operating a SBP; (iii) a guidebook on constructing/installing HDPE MLBPs; and (iv) a guidebook on operating HDPE MLBPs; (v) a guidebook on constructing a fixed dome MBP. In total the Project has delivered around 1,730 training courses. *rw*

³ MBP have a capacity of 51 – 499 cubic meters.

⁴ LBP have a capacity of 500 cubic meters or higher.

Table 3: Training to operators, masons, technicians, engineers and contractors (as of 31 March 2017)

	Provinces	Training to operators, masons, technicians, engineers and contractors (Component 1)								
		Operators	Women Operator	Masons	Women Mason	Technician	Women in management & tech issues	Engineer	Women Engineer	Contractor
0	CPMU					681	178	28	4	10
1	Lao Cai	2,303	506	49	4	27	7			
2	Son La	1,627	461	29	0	53	11			
3	Phu Tho	7,248	2,838	41	6	107	33			
4	Bac Giang	7,000	1,599	19	1	43	11			
5	Nam Dinh	3,977	1,624	0	0	40	8			
6	Ha Tinh	6,007	2,715	93	2	56	14			
7	Binh Dinh	6,860	3,103	25	0	53	8			
8	Tien Giang	2,604	1,061	34	0	25	4			
9	Ben Tre	5,987	1,754	28	5	22	1			
10	Soc Trang	3,103	782	57	1	73	2			
	Total	46,716	16,443	375	19	1,180	277	28	4	10
	Percentage		35.20%		5.07%		23.47%			

14. **National Biogas Database:** The Mission noted that as of 31 March 2017, the national biogas database was established; the software to merge data on biogas plants was procured. 31,772 biogas plants under the Project have been recorded in the database with 24,844 biogas plants recorded under both husband's and wife's names. However, during the inputting of data, some error occurred such as the data cannot be saved after inputting.

15. **Livestock environmental monitoring and biogas database management equipment.** ADB provided the No-objection letter to the Bidding Document of Package 14 on 18 November 2016. CPMU submitted the Bidding Document to APMB in January but until now, they have not received the approval form APMB to issue the Bidding Document. This package should be procured as soon as possible so that the equipment can be provided to provinces to facilitate the physical plant checking with environmental monitoring equipment.

16. **Needed actions:**

- (i) **SBP.** (i) Training to SBP operators should include the management to technical issues like SBP overload or excess gas with small demonstration. (ii) PPMUs should consult with the potential households whether they need to borrow a loan from Component 2 or not. (iii) PPMUs should contact the approved composite SBP suppliers to ensure that they provide the right SBP models to households with good maintenance schedule. (iv) CPMU and each PPMU should review the targets for providing ICMD funds of VND3 million and of VND5 million and determine whether the targets of 51,000 and 14,000 respectively can be achieved.
- (ii) **MBP.** CPMU and PPMUs need to develop a clear guidance to inform MBP operators of the conditions (i.e., commit to using all the gas produced by the plant and undertake a Rapid Environmental Assessment) under which they can avail of

the revised ICMD. In addition, MBP operators must also be provided technical assistance to design solutions that meet these conditions.

- (iii) **National Biogas Database.** CPMU to contact the software provider to fix the error as soon as possible.
- (iv) **Package 14.** APMB to provide the approval to the Bidding Document of this package. CPMU then to speed up the procurement process so that the contract can be awarded in July 2017.

Output 2: Credit Lines for Biogas Value Chains and other climate smart agriculture waste management investments

17. **Revised Targets after MTR.** The key performance indicators for this component are: (i) 50% of credit lines will be under joint accounts and/or on behalf of women by June 2019; and (ii) At least 15,000 households raising livestock have accessed credits for BVC and other climate smart agriculture waste management investments from the participating Financial Intermediaries by June 2019.

18. **Progress.** Both Financial Intermediaries (FIs), Vietnam Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development (VBARD) and Co-operative Bank of Vietnam (Co-opbank), have experienced difficulties in making loans to livestock farms. Of the US\$29.817 million provision, they have disbursed only VND15 billion (equivalent to US\$0.667 million) by 31 March 2017 as indicated in Table 4 below.

19. **VBSP inclusion as additional FI.** After ADB issued No-objection letter to the proposed changes in the MTR's MOU on 27 February 2017 accepting the VBSP inclusion, ADB and VBSP have been working closely to finalize the draft Project Agreement for signing. The issues have now been resolved and the Project Agreement is expected to be signed during the month of May.

Table 4: Status of credit lines (as of 31 March 2017)

No	Provinces	Credit lines number of sub-loans						Percent
		No. of sub loans_VBARD	Account on behalf of women	No. of sub loans_Coopbank	Account on behalf of women	Total no. of sub loans	Account on behalf of women	
0	CPMU							
1	Lao Cai	125	57			125	57	45.60%
2	Son La							
3	Phu Tho	5	0			5	0	0.00%
4	Bac Giang	53	5	74	11	127	16	12.60%
5	Nam Dinh							
6	Ha Tinh							
7	Binh Dinh	15	0	51	12	66	12	18.18%
8	Tien Giang	18	5			18	5	27.78%
9	Ben Tre							
10	Soc Trang							
	Total	216	67	125	23	341	90	26.39%

20. The Mission noted that the price of pork had dropped. This could affect the credit lines.

21. **Needed actions:**

- (i) ADB and VBSP to finalize the Project Agreement for signing
- (ii) CPMU to follow up with MOF on SBV's evaluation to VBSP
- (iii) VBSP to sign the Project Agreement with ADB, and the On-lending Agreement with MOF
- (iv) VBSP to prepare a realistic sub loan implementation schedule for quarters III and IV of 2017

Output 3: Enhanced climate-smart agricultural waste management practices (CSAWMP) technology transfer

22. **Revised Targets after MTR.** The key performance indicators for this component are: (i) CSAWMP research strategy developed and adaptive research on at least 6 CSAWMP topics conducted by June 2019. At least 2 research topics will include gender issues; (ii) At least 7 CSAWMP models are successfully demonstrated and disseminated in 10 participating provinces by June 2019; and (iii) At least 7,000 farmers, 700 extension staff, and 200 researchers trained on CSAMWPs by June 2019. At least 50% of farmers and 30% of extension staff trained are women.

23. **Progress. Farm-based Adaptive Research.** Among 6 topics approved during the MTR, ADB has provided No-objection letter to Submission 1: Evaluation of Expression of Interests and Shortlisting of 4 packages (package 25 to 28). Submission 0: Terms of Reference and Cost Estimate of Package 29 was submitted to ADB for review after a lot of discussion between ADB and EA. ADB and EA agreed to cancel package 30 after EA submitted Submission 0: Terms of Reference and Cost Estimate to ADB for review as the scope of the package does not directly contribute towards the project's outputs, outcome and impact. Also, both sides agreed to prepare additional research topics/packages to submit to ADB for review and approval. Among the approved packages, the Mission noted that the gender issues have not been included to at least 2 research topics.

Table 5: Status of research topics (as of 31 March 2017)

Package No.	Package name	Estimated amount (US\$)	Status
25	Research on organic fertilizer production from livestock waste and bio slurry by value chain	1,200,000	ADB issued NOL to Submission 1
26	Research on biogas technology improvement and effective biogas utilization by value chain	1,000,000	ADB issued NOL to Submission 1
27	Research on the water-saving pig farming technology	600,000	ADB issued NOL to Submission 1
28	Research on effective utilization of crop waste by value chain	1,000,000	ADB issued NOL to Submission 1
29	Research on the treatment of sludge sediment in shrimp farming	800,000	EA submitted Submission 0 to ADB for review
30	Research on the cultivation techniques for GHG emission reduction	1,018,000	Cancelled

24. **CSAWMP Demonstrations.** Another activity under this output is CSAWMP demonstrations. The objective of the demonstrations is to show case good agriculture waste management practices that have potential to be replicated in the Project area. ADB issued the No-objection letter to the Bidding Document of the prior-reviewed package 32 on 22 November 2016. However, as of 31 March 2017, the Bid Evaluation Report of this package has not been submitted to ADB for review. The Bidding Documents of other post-reviewed packages 33-38 have not been issued causing procurement delays.

Table 6: List of demonstration packages (as of 31 March 2017)

Package No.	Package name	Provinces	Estimated amount (US\$)	Status
32	Supply of manure separating systems to treat livestock waste to produce material for organic fertiliser demonstration	Bac Giang, Ben Tre, Binh Dinh, and Phu Tho	1,340,909	Bidding Document issued
33	Supply of manure separating system to treat livestock waste to produce material for organic fertiliser demonstration	Ha Tinh, Nam Dinh, Soc Trang, Son La, and Tien Giang	1,109,092	Bidding Document not issued yet
34	Supply of biogas generator and manure separating system for comprehensive management of livestock waste demonstration	Binh Dinh, Ha Tinh, Nam Dinh and Soc Trang	322,727	Bidding Document not issued yet
35	Supply of mobile manure separating system to treat livestock waste to produce material for organic fertilizer demonstration at household scale	Bac Giang, Ben Tre, Binh Dinh and Lao Cai	477,272	Bidding Document not issued yet
36	Supply of biogas generator system for demonstration	Binh Dinh, Ha Tinh, Lao Cai, Soc Trang and Tien Giang	513,637	Bidding Document not issued yet
37	Supply of utilisation system for treatment of biogas digested effluent demonstration as the fertiliser of the crops	Soc Trang and Binh Dinh	204,545	Bidding Document not issued yet
38	Supply of utilization system for treatment of cattle dung as the feedstock for red worm raising demonstration	Soc Trang	77,273	Bidding Document not issued yet

25. **CSAWMP Information System.** As of 31 March 2017, EA submitted the Submission 2: Technical Proposal Evaluation of Package 23: Design, monitoring, installation and technological transferring to e-library system to ADB for review. The contract of this package is expected to be awarded by Quarter II of 2017. The equipment package for the information system is expected to be awarded by Quarter I of 2018.

26. **Capacity building on CSAWMP.** The Project has supported 5 farmer vocational training programs (i.e. prepared syllabuses for farmer vocational training conducted by Department of Cooperatives and Rural Development) on the following topics: (i) production of biological fertilizer from cattle manure and sugarcane waste; (ii) skills for repairing and maintaining biogas equipment; (iii) raising red worms at small scale from cattle and chicken manure; (iv) Production of biological organic fertilizer from crop residue; and (v) production of organic fertilizer from pig manure. The project has committed to support the Department of Cooperatives and Rural Development of MARD to produce 3 more vocational training programs on the subjects of: (i) Production of biological bedding for livestock; (ii) Production of animal feed from crop residue; and (iii) Production of biochar from crop residue. The Mission noted that some of these topics are also the subjects of the research areas but at household level and not as comprehensively developed by value chain level as that in the research packages.

Table 7: Number of people trained on CSAWMP (as of 31 March 2017)

	Provinces	Number of people trained on CSAWMP (Component 3)			
		Farmers	Women farmers	Extension staff	Women extension staff
0	CPMU			236	54
1	Lao Cai	537	203	18	3
2	Son La	148	83	212	93
3	Phu Tho	845	528		
4	Bac Giang	900	615	37	21
5	Nam Dinh	1,819	919		
6	Ha Tinh	33	15	599	323
7	Binh Dinh	669	107	352	58
8	Tien Giang	1,074	756		
9	Ben Tre			322	60
10	Soc Trang	1,005	338		
	Total	7,030	3,564	1,776	612
	Percentage		50.70%		34.46%

27. **Needed actions:**

- (i) CPMU to speed up the recruitment process to research package 25-29 so that the contracts of these packages can be awarded by Quarter III, 2017.
- (ii) CPMU to reallocate the budget for the cancelled research package 30 to other packages. The Procurement Plan needs to be updated accordingly.
- (iii) CPMU to send the Bid Evaluation Report of prior-reviewed demonstration package 32 to ADB for review. The contract of this package is expected to be awarded in May 2017.
- (iv) CPMU to issue the Bidding Document of other post-reviewed demonstration packages from 33-38. The contracts of these packages are expected to be awarded in July 2017.

Output 4: Effective Project Management

28. **Revised Targets after MTR.** The key performance indicators for this component are: (i) A CPMU and 10 PPMUs established and operational with adequately skilled staff and facilities in MARD by first quarter of 2013. At least 30% of staff are women and a gender focal point will be appointed by 2014; and (ii) PPMS with sex-disaggregated and ethnicity data collected and reported operating effectively in 10 provinces by 2015.

29. **Progress. CPMU and PPMUs.** A CPMU and 10 PPMUs were established in second quarter of 2013 and are fully staffed. As of 31 March 2017, 55 out of 124 staffs (equivalent to 44.35%) of the CPMU and PPMUs are women. The gender focal point was appointed in July 2016.

30. **Loan Implementation Consultant (LIC).** The LIC team (formally referred to as Project Management Consulting Services) was mobilized only in November 2015 (30 months after loan effectiveness). Since mobilization, the firm has replaced 9 out of 24 experts due to personal circumstances faced by the specialists. The Mission noted that frequent replacement of specialist caused disruptions to project implementation. However, it was noted that the LIC is currently fully staffed and providing good support to CPMU and PPMUs.

C. Procurement of Civil Works, Goods and Consulting Services

31. **Progress.** The total contract value of procurements of civil works, goods and services carried out amount to US\$3.37 million, which is about 5% of the total project cost (US\$66.498 million). Main contracts awarded were Project Management Consulting Services, Project Auditing, Individual Consultants, Baseline Survey, Accountant Software, Database Management Software System, Map Sets on Agricultural Zones, Documentary Film and Documents on CSAWMP. Based on the latest approved Procurement Plan, key procurement packages within the next 18 months include Biogas Value Chain physical audit, 5 research packages, Livestock environmental monitoring and biogas database management equipment, E-library system (2 packages), Project Auditing (Phase 2), Project Monitoring and Evaluation software for CPMU and 10 PPMUs, and 7 demonstration packages, amounting to US\$11.35 million.

32. **Findings.** The Mission noted concern to the procurement process of most packages including 5 research packages, Livestock environmental monitoring and biogas database management equipment, E-library system consulting services package, Project Monitoring and Evaluation software for CPMU and 10 PPMUs, and 7 demonstration packages. These packages experienced long delays due to the limited capacity from EA when preparing the document for procurement and cumbersome approval process from APMB. The updated Procurement Plan in Appendix 3 includes some changes in procurement mode (research packages 25 and 26), lot number (demonstration package 36) or package addition (dissemination packages 39 and 40).

D. Project Monitoring and Evaluation and Reporting

33. **Findings.** The pending issues of Quarterly Project Progress Reports and Report for Review Mission remained. These reports mainly focused on activities but lacked clear explanations on how activities contribute towards outputs and outcome targets. Furthermore, inconsistencies of data in reports also reflect inconsistencies in recording of data at a given cut-off date. The international Project Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Specialist under the LIC was mobilized in October 2016 and she had the draft report to improve the M&E system as well as the report format. However, the report format has not been approved by CPMU and ADB.

34. **Needed actions.** CPMU and LIC to finalize the report format for ADB comments by May 2017. These report formats will be used by CPMU and PPMUs for quarterly report and report for review mission.

E. Project Costs and Financing

35. **Contract Awards and Disbursement.** As per ADB's Loan Financial Information Services, as of 31 March 2017, cumulative contract award was US\$12.449 million against US\$66.498 million net loan amount, equivalent to 18.72% versus elapsed time of 66%. As of 31 March 2017, cumulative disbursement was US\$15.272 million against US\$66.498 million net loan amount, equivalent to 22.97% versus elapsed time of 66%. The disbursement amount includes the Advance to Imprest Account of US\$3.500 million to CPMU and US\$3.400 million to the 2 FIs but excludes 1 pending Withdrawal Application amounted at US\$1.490 million. However, CPMU recorded the contract awards amount of US\$14.325 million and disbursement amount of \$12.056 million excluding the Advance to Imprest Account of US\$6.900 million.

36. **2017 ODA allocation.** Delay in allocating ODA to CPMU and PPMUs by MOF and PPCs has caused a lot of difficulties in project implementation, especially disbursement. No disbursement activities could be done in Quarter I of 2017 due to lack of ODA allocation. As of 31 March 2017, all PPMUs have received the allocation decision from respective PPCs except for Nam Dinh and Soc Trang PPMUs. Disbursement ceiling has become an issue in CPMU when the needs for ODA fund far exceeded the allocated amount.

Table 8: Status of ODA allocation (as of 31 March 2017)

Unit: VND million

No.	Contents	ODA Allocation	ODA needs	Shortage
1	CPMU	7,700	58,150	50,450
2	Son La	5,800	5,800	0
3	Lao Cai	14,200	14,200	0
4	Phu Tho	20,400	20,400	0
5	Bac Giang	12,800	12,800	0
6	Nam Dinh	10,300	10,300	0
7	Ha Tinh	14,400	14,400	0

No.	Contents	ODA Allocation	ODA needs	Shortage
8	Binh Dinh	14,600	14,600	0
9	Tien Giang	7,800	7,800	0
10	Ben Tre	8,300	8,300	0
11	Soc Trang	9,000	9,000	0
	Total	125,300	175,750	50,450

37. The Contract Awards and Disbursement Projections until project end is prepared based on the Project Detailed Implementation Plans of CPMU, 10 PPMUs, and 3 FIs in Appendix 4.

38. **Audited Financial Statements.** The next Auditor's Report will be due on 30 June 2017. The Mission reminded EA to submit the Audited Financial Statements on time.

39. **Counterpart Funds.** The Project reported that adequate funds have been provided for 2017. The cumulative counterpart funds released as of end-March 2017 is VND31.225 billion (equivalent to US\$1.387 million).

40. **Needed actions.**

- (i) CPMU to send request for Project Contract Summary Sheet (PCSS) issuance and the Withdrawal Applications in a more regular basis to narrow the data difference between ADB and CPMU and to increase the turnover ratio.
- (ii) Nam Dinh and Soc Trang PPCs to issue the ODA allocation decision to 2 respectively PPMUs so that these PPMUs can process their Withdrawal Applications.
- (iii) MOF to supplement the ODA allocation to CPMU whenever there is an update to ODA allocation.

F. Compliance with Loan Covenants

41. The Mission finds the loan covenants to be generally complied or being complied with. An updated schedule of covenants is given in Appendix 5.

G. Environmental Issues

42. **Original Targets.** The project objective is to reduce pollution from agricultural waste by using CSAWMP. The project aims to support processing agricultural and rural household waste into clean energy and organic fertilizer from bio-slurry, and disseminate, strengthen, and diversify the knowledge base for the application of CSAWMP. The project aims to target environmental monitoring of at least 5% of SBPs.

43. **Progress.** Project in general contributes to positive impacts on the environment, improving environmental sanitation at household and community level, supporting the Commune to achieve the target of environmental criteria for the "New Rural Commune", by improving livestock waste management practices, reducing water and air pollution from agriculture as well as reducing GHG from waste management. The project also contributes to strengthening capacity at provincial, district and commune level in managing agricultural wastes. The mission noted that the project inspected from 8.2% (Lao Cai) to 21% of SBPs (in Son La), exceeded the

monitoring target. In order to follow-up environmental issues raised during the MTR, an Environmental Unit established for strengthening capacity on environmental management, monitoring and reporting.

44. **Findings.** The project contributed to improve environmental sanitation and generate clean energy and reduce GHG in the 10 provinces with successfully implementation of the SBP construction at household and commune levels to achieve the New Rural Commune's environmental criteria.

45. However, some environmental issues identified during the last MTR mission are still unsolved for SBPs, such as (i) inappropriate bio-slurry effluent treatment before releasing to the surface water; (ii) overloading with solid waste in SBPs resulting in reduction of the quality of the biogas plant and increase water pollution from bio-slurry effluent. Overload issues frequently occurs in provinces where households use of composite models volume from 7 to 9 m³ such as Son La and Soc Trang while the effluent treatment issues more severe in Soc Trang province. The mission has not visited any LBP/MBP supported by the project in Soc Trang and Son La Provinces as there are no LBP/MBPs in construction and operation yet, however, visiting LBPs in the two provinces, financed by the livestock farm's owner, registered for application of pilot CSAWMP, issues of surplus biogas and/or releasing unburned biogas were obvious.

46. **Needed Actions.** The following corrective actions proposed to be carried out to secure environmental safeguard compliance and to achieve the project objectives of reducing pollution from agricultural waste by using CSAWMP.

- (i) CPMU and LIC environmental safeguard consultant and Biogas technical consultant should provide guidance and training and consulting services for PPMUs to help household in managing bio-slurry treatment before release to the environment or use as fertilizer, as well as overcome the overloading issue of SBPs.
- (ii) For MBP, in addition to REA and environmental categorization form, an EMP with specific mitigation measure of releasing biogas into the atmosphere or/and burning surplus biogas, as well as using bio-slurry and livestock waste for agriculture.
- (iii) A comprehensive approach with the biogas value chain and CSAWMP application should be seen as an overall solution for the project to meet its objectives of reducing GHG and improving environmental quality.

H. Social Safeguards Issues

47. **Original Targets.** The target of construction of SBPs for EMs with at least 5% of SBP constructed in DMF has not been achieved in 3 selected provinces including Son La, Bac Giang and Soc Trang. (Total SBPs have been constructed for EMs in three targeted provinces is 2,166 SBPs, out of total 45,869 SBPs for whole project, equivalent 4.7%), as of March 31 2017. However, total SBPs have been constructed for EMs in 5 provinces with EMs present (including Lao cai and Phu Tho) is 3,135 SBPs, equivalent 6.8%.

48. **Progress.** By 31 March 2017, achievements on project implementation for EM people are summarized as follows and details in the Appendix 6.

49. In total, 3,135 SBPs for EMs equivalent to 6.8% of total constructed SBPs in 5 provinces with EM (including three targeted provinces are Son La, Bac Giang and Soc Trang and 2 additional provinces, which have sizable EM populations: Lao Cai, and Phu Tho). The progress of constructing SPB for household under three criteria is on-going by taking the list of households to meet the criteria (poor/near poor, ethnic minority and/or female bread-winner households) by PPMU under guideline of CPMU that just sent to PPMUs on Mid of April.

50. Dissemination activities: As of 31 March 2017, in total, serving information dissemination purpose, the PPMUs has developed and organized:

- Dissemination workshops: 431;
- TV programs: 101
- Radio programs (in ethnic languages also): 4,436
- Articles on newspapers: 123
- Leaflet: 130,000
- Information boards: 4,641
- Posters: 19,500;
- Video clip: 25;
- Banner: 200;
- Hand book: 100

51. The Project provided training course on BP operation and CSAWMP for participants to manage their livestock and wastes. As of 31 March 2017, 1,220 EMs out of 8,570 households were trained on CSAWMP in 10 provinces (equivalent to 14.02% of total CSAWMP trainees). 2,839 EMs were trained on biogas operation, equivalent to 6.1% of total.

52. The Project conducted ToT for 1,776 extension staffs on CSAWMP. Among them, 209 are EM trainees (equivalent to 35.9% of total trainees).


53. As of 31 March 2017, 2 FIs provide credit to 341 participants in Bac Giang, Lao Cai, Phu Tho, Tien Giang and Binh Dinh, of which 92 are EMs, equivalent to 27.0% of total access to this source.

54. **Findings.** All activities for EMs in approved IPDP have been integrated in project activities and project has positive impacts on EMs people and community. EMs were involved in all project activities as Kinh people. Via field trips and interviewing the EM beneficiaries, local authorities and PPMUs, Mission found that Soc Trang province have supported EMs by providing interpreter on Ethnic language during the training, support EMs on procedure of borrowing from Vietnam Bank for Social Policies by other program with support of cooperatives, project commune and districts. Mission did not find specific activities for EMs in Son La province.

55. A lot of information dissemination has been done in the 10 provinces but there are no specific communication activities for EM. In addition, the consultation for EMs before training has not been carried out and the evaluation after training for EMs has not been conducted.

56. As recommended in MTR Gender and Ethnic Minority specialist under LIC has been mobilized and support to CPMU and PPMUs for reporting. The first internal monitoring on IPDP implementation has been submitted to ADB on January 2017;

57. By interviewing some representatives of local authorities, PPMUs, mission found an inadequate understanding of the requirements in IPDP by the local authorities as well as PPMUs;

58. As agreed in MTR that other project provinces which have sizable EM populations (Lao Cai, Binh Dinh, Phu Tho and Ha Tinh) shall also prioritize the EMs for support under the Project. However, Ha Tinh and Binh Dinh province have recommended during the mission that there is no Ethnic minority household in project area thus they do not follow the activities of IPDP for EMs as recommended in MTR. 

59. Needed Actions.

- (i) PPMUs are requested to (i) disseminate the IPDP to project districts, communes; (ii) prepare detail plan for implementation the requirements specified in the IPDP to encourage the EMs participate in IPDP activities, especially increase of number of SBPs constructed for EMs, number of EMs attending in training courses on operating SBP and CSWAMP, number of EMs participating in demonstration of CSWAMP, vocational training for alternative livelihoods related to biogas and its value chains management to EMs; (iii) strengthen communication activities direct to Ethnic minorities, including project information dissemination at village and commune levels; (iv) Coordinate with VBSB for supporting EM households to access the project credit; (v) Ha tinh and Binh Dinh are requested to review and prepare the report on Ethnic minority in project area and submit to LIC/CPMU for review then submit to ADB to explain why no EM activities are carried out to follow the requirements at IPDP as recommended in MTR;
- (ii) Social staff of PPMUs is supported by Gender and Ethnic Minority specialist under LIC and social staff of CPMU to (i) monitor the implementation of activities in IPDP for EMs; (ii) update regularly in the current report system; (iii) cooperate with local authorities to conduct consultation meeting with EMs before training to ensure the provision of information and training materials in a form of appropriate language that understood by participating EM and their literacy level. The number of training to EMs may increase based on the results of consultation with EMs.
- (iii) CPMU is requested to (i) timely provision support PPMUs for all activities in IPDP such as training, communication activities and others; (ii) monitoring the implementation of IPDP as planned; (iii) submit to ADB the second internal monitoring on IPDP on July 2017 with updating monitoring table of IPDP, detail progress for implementation of activities that have not been implemented as of April 2017, separate reporting the number of household under three criteria have been constructed SPB.

I. Gender Issues

60. **Revised Targets after MTR:** The key gender action plan's targets (in covenant) include (i) at least 20% of those who are trained in biogas management and technical issues are women; (ii) at least 7% of those who are trained and certified as masons for the construction of small Biogas Plants are women (iii) at least 50% of those trained on utilization of biogas technology and operation and maintenance are women; (iv) at least 50% of those who are trained on farm management and waste management on farms are women; (v) at least 15% of employees trained in medium Biogas Plants and large Biogas Plants are women; (vi) at least 50% of recipients of Sub-loans from FIs will be registered under husband-wife joint accounts or on behalf of women; (vii) at least 50% of official registration of all purchased biogas units and plants under the Project will be under husband-wife joint accounts or on behalf of women; (viii) 30% of research topics related to gender issues associated with Biogas Plants; (ix) at least 30% of those selected as champions of smart-agriculture in research and dissemination of CSAWMP technology are women; (x) training materials of CSAWMP technology and methodology of dissemination will be women-friendly and at least 30% of dissemination events and consultations will involve women-only groups; (xi) a sex-disaggregated and ethnic minority data base is established as part of the Project's project performance and monitoring system established by the CPMU; (xii) 30% of staff in the CPMU and PPMUs are women and that the CPMU and each PPMU has a gender focal point; and (xiii) gender indicators are included in the overall monitoring and evaluation framework for the Project.

61. **Progress.** Based on the updated GAP monitoring table, the project GAP implementation is on track with:

- 40 % of actions (2 out of 5) are achieved, 60% of actions (3 out of 5) are on track; and 1 action not yet done. Total of actions: 6
- 10% of targets (1 of 10) are achieved; 60% of targets (6 out of 10) are likely achieved; 30% of targets (3 out of 10) are unlikely achieved and 2 targets not yet due. Total of targets: 12.

62. **The main results are:** i) 24 training courses on biogas management and technical issues for technical workers in 10 provinces with 277 female participants/1,180 participants (23.5%, which is higher than the target of 20%); (ii) 14 training courses on SBP construction with 19/ 375 female participants (5.0% , which is below target of 7%); (iii) 1,682 training courses on utilization of biogas technology and operation and maintenance with 46,716 participants and 36,161 peoples were trained at-home. Total of participants is 82,877 including 40,607 female participants (49%, which is below the target of 50%); (iv) 3,564 female farmers/7,030 farmers participated in the training courses on farm management and waste management on farms (50.7%, which is achieved the target of 50%); (v) 2 training courses in medium Biogas Plants and large Biogas Plants for engineers and representative from 10 contractors with 4/38 female participants (10.2%, which is below the target of 15%); (vi) and (vii) 341 recipients of Sub-loans, of which 90 credit recipients were registered under husband-wife joint accounts or on behalf of women (26.4%, which is below the target is 50%); (ix) 612/1,776 female participants participated in the training courses on CSAWMP technology (34.5%, which is higher than the target of 30%) ; (x) training materials of CSAWMP technology and methodology of dissemination are women-friendly. (xi) 431 dissemination meetings and workshops were organized, of which 4 dissemination events and consultant involved women-only groups (1%, which is lower than the target of 30%); (xii) a sex-disaggregated and ethnic minority data base is established as part of the Project's project performance and monitoring system established by the CPMU; (xiii) 124 staff in the CPMU and PPMUs, including 55 female staff (44.4%, which is higher than the target is 30%) and the CPMU and each PPMU has a gender focal point; and (xiv) 3 gender sensitivity workshops were carried out for gender focal points of PPMUs, technical staff and stakeholders with 142 participants, of which 97 female participants (68%).

63. **Findings:** The following issues were identified during the Review Mission:

- (i) The rate of female participated in training courses is lower than project target (SBP construction: 5.0%, which is below target of 7%; medium scale (MBP) and large scale (LBP) biogas plants: 8.7%, which is below the target of 15%).
- (ii) Only 1% of dissemination events and consultant involved women-only groups (below the target of 30%).
- (iii) During the field visit to Soc Trang province, the mission noted that:
 - a. Soc Trang PPMU conducted workshops on project introduction and guided the potential households who will participate in the project on lending procedures of Vietnam Bank for Social Policies and connected them with the Bank, CPCs and potential households for borrowing money by trust. So procedures on financial support for households who want to borrow money will be processed faster and simple.
 - b. The construction of biogas plants has changed the perception of livestock farmers livestock farmers' waste control habit that waste must be treated before discharge into environment and use biogas as alternative energy for cooking. This contribute to improve environmental health and human health, especially women
 - c. The rate of female participants attended the training courses is lower than project target (trainings on biogas technology and O&M with 782/3,103 female

participants (25.2%), SBP construction: 1/57 female participant (2.7%); biogas management and technical issues: 3/73 female participants (3%).

64. **Needed Actions.**

- (i) CPMU and PPMUs monitor and encourage female participation in training courses to achieve the GAP targets.
- (ii) PPMUs need to conduct dissemination events, consultation to inform about the project and CSAWMP technology and to ensure 30% of dissemination events and consultation to be involved with women-only groups and conducted through commune women union's meetings where women-only groups will be organized.
- (iii) PPMUs need to guide the credit recipients that the account name of credit recipients should be registered under the names of husband and wife or only woman on behalf to ensure the GAP target is 50%.
- (iv) For the research project topics, gender specialist needs to coordinate CPMU and contractors in the implementation of these researches to ensure that 30% of research project topics related to gender issues.
- (v) CPMU and PPMUs conduct to train gender awareness and brief GAP for key project staff (at least coordinator, gender focal, implementers and technicians as part of the new training).

III. FOLLOW UP ACTIVITIES

65. The Mission reiterates its concern for the progress of the project. The follow table presents the agreed upon actions that will be carried out before the next review mission.

Table 9: Agreed Follow-up Actions

No	Issue	Agreed Action	Time frame	Responsibility
1	Output 1: Expanded Use of Livestock Waste Management Infrastructure	(i) Support NBP's efforts to obtain CER credits for biogas plants supported under the Project	Continuously implementing up to end of project	CPMU
		(ii) Procedures and templates for random checks of biogas plant to be revised to include environmental monitoring parameters and reports	May 2017	CPMU
		(iii) The registration for SBP construction with ICMD funds of VND3 million and of VND5 million should be reviewed whether it can meet the target of 51,000 and 14,000 SBPs accordingly. MBP guidelines and technical guidance for operator to be able to meet the requirements.	June 2017	CPMU, PPMUs
		(iv) The database software provider to be contacted to fix the error as soon as possible	June 2017	CPMU, PPMUs
		(v) Approval to the Bidding Document of Package 14	May 2017	APMB
		(vi) Contract awarded to package 14	July 2017	CPMU
2	Output 2: Credit Lines for Biogas	(i) Finalization of the Project Agreement for signing	May 2017	ADB

No	Issue	Agreed Action	Time frame	Responsibility
	Value Chains and other climate smart agriculture waste management investments	(ii) Follow up with MOF on SBV's evaluation to VBSP	May 2017	CPMU
		(iii) Project Agreement signing	May 2017	ADB, VBSP
		(iv) On-lending Agreement signing	June 2017	VBSP, MOF
		(v) Preparation of realistic sub loan implementation schedule for quarters III and IV of 2017	June 2017	VBSP
3	Output 3: Enhanced Climate Smart Agricultural Waste Management Practices Technology Transfer	(i) Contract award to research packages 25-29	Q III 2017	CPMU
		(ii) Contract award to demonstration prior-reviewed package 32	May 2017	CPMU
		(iii) Contract award to demonstration post-reviewed packages 33-38	July 2017	CPMU
4	Output 4: Effective Project Management	(i) Finalization of report format	May 2017	CPMU, LIC
		(ii) Issuance of the ODA allocation decision in Soc Trang and Nam Dinh PPMUs	May 2017	Soc Trang and Nam Dinh PPCs
		(iii) Supplement the ODA allocation to CPMU	Q III 2017	MOF
5	Environmental Safeguard Recommendations	(i) Organize a training course for PPMUs on environmental safeguard	May 2017	CPMU/LIC
		(ii) Procure environmental monitoring equipment and start environmental effect monitoring	July 2017	CPMU/PPMU
		(iii) Mobilize environmental safeguard and biogas technical consultants under LIC to support PPMUs in managing bio-slurry treatment before release to the environment or use as fertilizer	May-June 2017	CPMU/LIC/PPMUs
		(iv) Mobilize environmental safeguard and biogas technical consultants under LIC to support PPMU in solving the overloading issue of SBPs	May-June 2017	CPMU/LIC/PPMUs
		(v) Mobilize environmental safeguard and biogas technical consultants under LIC to help PPMU in preparation of an EMP with specific mitigation measure, avoid release biogas into the atmosphere or/and burning surplus biogas, as well as using bio-slurry and livestock waste for agriculture.	May-June 2017	CPMU/LIC/PPMUs
6	EM Recommendations	i) Disseminate the IPDP to project districts, communes;	May 2017	
		(ii) Prepare detail plan for implementation the requirements specified in the IPDP	May 2017	CPMU/LIC/PPMU

No	Issue	Agreed Action	Time frame	Responsibility
		(iii) Strengthen communication activities direct to Ethnic minorities, including project information dissemination at village and commune levels;	Continuously implementing up to end of project	CPMU/LIC/PPMU
		(iv) Coordinate with VBSB for supporting EM households to access the project credit;	Continuously implementing up to end of project	PPMU
		(v) Ha Tinh and Binh Dinh are requested to review and prepare the report on Ethnic minority in project area and submit to LIC/CPMU for review then submit to ADB	May 2017	CPMU/LIC/PPMU Ha Tinh, PPMU Binh Dinh
		(vi) Conduct consultation meeting with EMs before training to ensure the provision of information and training materials in a form of appropriate language	Before trainings	PPMUs/ local authorities
		(vii) Monitoring the implementation of IPDP as planned and submit to ADB the second internal monitoring on IPDP on July 2017	Continuously implementing and July 2017 for submitting	CPMU/ PPMUs
7	GAP recommendations	(i) CPMU and PPMUs monitor and encourage female participation in training courses to achieve the GAP targets	Continuously implementing up to end of project	
		(ii) PPMUs need to conduct dissemination events, consultation to inform about the project and CSAWMP technology and to ensure 30% of dissemination events and consultation to be involved with women-only groups	Continuously implementing up to end of project	PPMU
		(iii) PPMUs need to guide the credit recipients that the account name of credit recipients should be registered under the names of husband and wife or only woman on behalf to ensure the project target is 50%.	Continuously implementing up to end of project	PPMU
		(iv) For the research project topics, gender specialist needs to coordinate CPMU and contractors in the implementation of these researches to ensure that 30% of research project topics related to gender issues	December 2017	CPMU, Gender specialist and contractors
		(v) CPMU and PPMUs conduct to train gender awareness and brief GAP for key project staff (at least	December 2017	CPMU, PPMUs and Gender specialist

No	Issue	Agreed Action	Time frame	Responsibility
		coordinator, gender focal, implementers and technicians as part of the new training)		
8	Review mission	Next Review Mission	Q IV 2017	ADB

IV. ACKNOWLEDGMENT

66. The Mission wishes to express its sincere appreciation for the cooperation and assistance extended by MARD, APMB and 10 IAs during the Mission. In particular, the Mission noted its appreciation to Vice Minister Mr. Le Quoc Doanh for prioritizing this Project for close supervision.

Signed in Ha Noi on 25 May 2017 by:



Mr. Sanath D.B. Ranawanna
Senior Natural Resources Economist
Environment, Natural Resources and
Agriculture Division
Asian Development Bank



Mr. Chu Van Chuong
Deputy Director General
International Cooperation Department
Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

List of Appendixes

No	Title of Appendixes
1	List of Participants
2	Project overall physical progress
3	Updated Procurement Plan
4	Contract Awards and Disbursement Projections
5	Compliance with Loan Covenants
6	Updated Ethnic Minority Development Plan
7	Updated Gender Action Plan Monitoring Table

List of Key Persons Met

Name	Position	Email Account	Tel. No
MARD			
Chu Văn Chuông	Deputy Director General of ICD		
Lê Minh Tuấn	Staff of ICD		
Tạ Hữu Nghĩa	Head of Department of Cooperative		
Nguyễn Văn Hùng	Staff of Department of Finance		
Tổng Xuân Chinh	Deputy Director General of DLP		
Nguyễn Xuân Khôi	Staff of DSTE		
Ngô Thị Kim Cúc	Vice Head of NIAH		
Nguyễn Hoàng Long	Vice Head of VAAS		
Other line ministries			
Nguyễn Thế Hiển	Staff of Ministry of Finance		
Nguyễn Quỳnh Phương	Staff of State Bank of Viet Nam		
APMB			
Nguyễn Thế Hình	Deputy Director General		
Phạm Việt Anh	Staff of Planning and Technical Division		
Vũ Ngọc Hà	Vice Head		
Đặng Hữu Kiên	Vice Head, Consultant Management Division		
Central Project Management Unit			
Nguyễn Thế Hình	Project Director	nguyenthe.hinh@gmail.com	0913247782
Vũ Tiến Dũng	Deputy Project Director		0913543045
Hoàng Thái Ninh	Deputy Project Director	hoangthaininh@gmail.com	
Nguyễn Văn Chung	Staff	chungnguyenvanhd@yahoo.com	01682578578

Nguyễn Thái Sơn	Environment Officer		0902468122
Nguyễn Đình Diệu	Accountant		0903403695
Phạm Thùy Linh	Officer (Gender and EM)	linh.phan.mp@gmail.com	0904266568
Bùi Thuỳ Linh	Staff		
Dương Thị Diễm Hằng	Staff		
Nguyễn Thị Thanh Nga	Staff		
Phạm Thị Hương	Staff		
Trịnh Thị Thuý Hối	Staff		
Phan Thùy Linh	Staff		
Hoàng Thị Thu Hằng	Staff		
Nguyễn Thị Ngọc Lan	Staff		
Nguyễn Thị Minh Hương	Staff		
Trần Diễm My	Staff		
Trần Phương Thảo	Staff		
Đỗ Ngọc Anh	Staff		
Nguyễn Thị Thành	Staff		
Đỗ Thanh Hương	Staff		
Vũ Hồng Hải	Staff		
Loan Implementation Consultants			
Manohar Sreshtha	Team Leader	manoharshrestha28@gmail.com	
Hồ Thị Lan Hương	Consultant		
Phạm Thị Vượng	Consultant		
Nguyễn Thị Bích Hạnh	Consultant		
Bùi Văn Chính	Consultant		
Financial Intermediates			
Ngô Diệu An	Deputy Director General, Agribank		

Hồ Thị Kim Thanh	Officer, Agribank	thanhhothikim@agribank.com.vn	0913207917
Lê Thu Hà	Vice Head, Coopbank		
Tăng Hòa	Officer, International Cooperation Division, Viet Nam Bank for Social Policies		0936935789
Đỗ Nguyễn Thanh Nhung	Staff of Coopbank		
ADB			
Sanath Ranawana	Senior Natural Resources Economist		
Trương Minh Huệ	Associate Project Analyst		
Phạm Ánh Tuyết	Consultant		
Trần Thúy Hải	Consultant		
Tien Giang province			
Huynh Thanh Nong	Vice Project Director, PPMU		0983801049
Nguyen Thi Hoang Ngan	Chief Accountant, PPMU		0983238890
Nguyen Thanh Hoa	Accountant, PPMU		
Nguyen Thi Huynh	Officer (Gender and EM)	gseaptiengiang@gmail.com	0975171825
Ben Tre province			
Nguyen The Nghia	Project Coordinator, PPMU		01699073793
Nguyen Khanh Binh	Technical Officer, PPMU	Ncbinh.knkn@yahoo.com.vn	0919240240
Luu Quang Vinh	Officer (Gender and EM)	vinhlequang11@gmail.com	0906027909
Soc Trang province			
Quach Van Tay	Project Director, PPMU	taycctyst@gmail.com	0913708736
Tran Van Chien	Deputy Project Director, PPMU		
Le Van Quang	Project Coordinator cum Technical Officer, PPMU	Levanquang68@gmail.com	0918573883
Huynh Duc Thang	PPMU		
Võ Phú Lâm	PPMU		
Cao Tấn Đạt	PPMU		

Nguyễn Ngọc Lâm Tuyền	Officer (Gender and EM)	lamtuyen8989@gmail.com	0919162522
Tran Huong Thao	PPMU		
Dao Van Thong	Provincial Consultant		
Pham Minh Tu	Vice Head of Animal Health Center, Phu My District		0919316771
Van Vu Phat	Officer, My Tu District Animal Health Center		0918021922
Nguyen Phu Nhuan	Officer, My Tu District Animal Health Center		
Hàng Huỳnh The	Farmer, Thuan Huong commune, My Tu District		
Lâm Sol	Farmer, Thuan Huong commune, My Tu District		
Yên Nhữ	Farmer, Thuan Huong commune, My Tu District		
Kham Many	Farmer, Thuan Huong commune, My Tu District		
Yên Lụy (wife of Kham Many)	Farmer, Thuan Huong commune, My Tu District		
Lý Thị Lượng	Farmer, Thuan Huong commune, My Tu District		
Yên Thị Sương	Farmer, Thuan Huong commune, My Tu District		
Trịnh Thị Thu Vân	Farmer, Thuan Huong commune, My Tu District		
Dương Sơn	Farmer, Thuan Huong commune, My Tu District		
Nguyễn Thị Thu Hà			
Phạm Trần Công			
Trần Ngọc Hải	Farmer, Lich Hoi Thuong commune, Tran De district		
Binh Dinh province (PPMU address: 110 Tran Hung Dao, Quy Nhon city, Binh Dinh province)			
Dao Van Hung	Project Director, PPMU	lcaspbinhdinh@gmail.com	056. 3946771
Huynh Ngoc Diep	Deputy Project Director, PPMU		
Le Ngoc Hung	PPMU		
Ho Thi Giac Ngan	Officer (Gender and EM)	Lcaspbinhdinh@gmail.com	0935970309
Nam Dinh Province			
Hoang Thi To Nga	Project Director, PPMU	Ngasam67@gmail.com	0918951967
Vu Duc Luu	Chief Accountant, PPMU	vuduclusnnd@gmail.com	0903212730

Nguyen Trong Tan	Project Coordinator, PPMU	Trongtan78@gmail.com	0913472700
Nguyen T. Minh Giang	Technical Officer, PPMU (Gender)	Minhgiang170@gmail.com	0988910407
Lao Cai province			
Nguyen Thi Khanh Hoa	Project Officer, PPMU		0974581286
Nguyen Dinh Tam	Project Officer, PPMU		01655551999
Hoang Manh Thang	Project Officer, PPMU (Gender & EM)	mthangbio@gmail.com	0969134154
Son La Province			
Le Van Thanh	Project Director, PPMU	Lcaspsonla@gmail.com	0904109456
Lo Thanh Bang	Project Coordinator, PPMU	Banglothan75@gmail.com	0988432886
Tran Thi Hai Yen	Accountant, PPMU		0967788936
Nguyen Huu Thuong	Project Officer, PPMU	timbanthatkho@gmail.com	0975113688
Cam Ngoc Vinh	Project Officer, PPMU		0972653288
Nguyen Quoc Hoan	Project Officer, PPMU		0988652991
Ngo Thi Loan	Officer (Gender and EM), PPMU	loanttnsl@gmail.com	0904272638
Bàn Văn Lợi	Chairman, CPC of Phieng Luong, Moc Chau district		
Lương Trọng Hải	Extension Officer, Phieng Luong commune, Moc Chau district		
Nguyễn Ngọc Dũng	Extension Officer, Moc Chau district		
Bàn Thị Dung	Farmer, Phieng Luong commune, Moc Chau district		
Đặng Thị Vân	Chairwoman, Phieng Luong commune Women's Union		
Bàn Văn Tâm	Farmer, Phieng Luong commune, Moc Chau district		
Lý Thị Sáng	Farmer, Phieng Luong commune, Moc Chau district		
Nguyễn Thạch Lỗi	Farmer, Moc Chau town		
Hoàng Thị Phiếu	Farmer, Chieng Dong commune, Yen Chau district		
Đào Văn Trang	Farmer, Chieng Dong commune, Yen Chau district		
Phu Tho province			

Tu Anh Son	Deputy Director of DARD - Project Director, PPMU	tusonpt@gmail.com	0989149457
Nguyen Thi Kim Thoa	Accountant, PPMU	nguyenthikimthoa243@gmail.com	01675700098
Tu Trung Hieu	Technical Officer, PPMU		0982407333
Hoang Manh Thong	Project Officer, PPMU (gender and EM)	Hoangmanhthong1984@gmail.com	01685627899
Ha Tinh province			
Nguyen Huu Men	Technical Officer, PPMU (Gender and EM)	huumenhatinh@gmail.com	0932340005
Nguyen Xuan Liem	Head of Financial Division		
Dinh Ngoc Duc	Technical Officer, PPMU		
Bac Giang province			
Dao Xuan Vinh	Project Coordinator, PPMU	daoxuanvinhbg@gmail.com	0983015971
Duong The Khoa	Technical Officer, PPMU		0985588750
Luu Thi Phuong Dung	Gender staff, PPMU	luudung85bg@gmail.com	0976908797

OVERALL PROJECT PHYSICAL PROGRESS

No.	Components/Activities	Cost	Weight	Dis amount	Rated Progress (0 - 100)	Weighted Progress
	Component 1: Expanded Use of Livestock Waste Management Infrastructure					
	Standardizing and disseminating a design package for BVC infrastructure	2,500,000	3.68%	1,164,536	47	1.71%
	Strengthening the monitoring capacity of relevant agencies to hand over and monitor the constructed biogas plant	2,459,300	3.62%	633,293	26	0.93%
	Monitoring the disbursement of funds paid to Eligible Beneficiaries as a financial incentive to carry out Eligible Subprojects	10,485,455	15.44%	5,631,319	54	8.29%
	Capacity building in designing, constructing, operating and monitoring biogas plants	1,209,726	1.78%	483,647	40	0.71%
	Strengthening the capacity and providing equipment for relevant agencies to manage national biogas database	343,682	0.51%	82,089	24	0.12%
	Component 2: Credit Lines for Biogas Value Chains and other climate smart agriculture waste management investments					
	FIs to provide credit lines to Eligible Beneficiaries to finance Biogas Value Chain Infrastructure and other climate smart agriculture waste management investments which satisfy the Subproject Eligibility Criteria	29,817,452	43.90%	666,667	2	0.98%
	Component 3: Enhanced CSAWMP technology transfer					
	Utilizing farmer-based research including using biochar and other agricultural wastes as organic fertilizers; applying other efficient low greenhouse gas emission agricultural practices which generate bioenergy; managing waste treatments in aquaculture and other CSAWMP	5,637,583	8.30%	21,442	0	0.03%
	Developing livestock waste management models for agricultural production and greenhouse gas emission reductions	4,306,732	6.34%	43,646	1	0.06%
	Capacity building of researchers, extension staff and farmers including vocational training program, training packages and study tours on CSAWMP	1,206,182	1.78%	361,953	30	0.53%

	Establish an information system (e-library, map sets on agro-ecological zones and distance learning system) to disseminate awareness and knowledge CSAWMP	790,000	1.16%	117,077	15	0.17%
	Component 4: Effective project management					
	Establish CPMU and PPMUs to be operational; Conduct a gender awareness raising workshop for PMUs, IDC	6,177,009	9.09%	1,542,843	25	2.27%
	Engage consultants for start-up and auditing, and to develop the PPMS, with sex- and ethnicity-disaggregated data and including gender action plan monitoring; Undertake baseline surveys in all project provinces with collection and analysis of sex- and ethnicity-disaggregated data; Prepare progress reports and submit to ADB on a regular basis	2,986,820	4.40%	1,035,078	35	1.52%
	Total	67,919,941	100%	11,783,590	298	17.35%

APPENDIX 3: PROCUREMENT PLAN

Basic Data

Project Name: Low Carbon Agricultural Support Project	
Project Number: 45406-001	Approval Number: 2968
Country: Viet Nam, Socialist Republic of	Executing Agency: Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
Project Procurement Classification:	Implementing Agency: N/A
Project Procurement Risk:	
Project Financing Amount: US\$ 84,000,000 ADB Financing: US\$ 74,000,000 Cofinancing (ADB Administered): Non-ADB Financing: US\$ 10,000,000	Project Closing Date: 31 March 2020
Date of First Procurement Plan: 12 December 2012	Date of this Procurement Plan: 03 May 2017, Version 7

A. Methods, Thresholds, Review and 18-Month Procurement Plan

1. Procurement and Consulting Methods and Thresholds

Except as the Asian Development Bank (ADB) may otherwise agree, the following process thresholds shall apply to procurement of goods and works.

Procurement of Goods and Works		
Method	Threshold	Comments
International Competitive Bidding for Goods	US\$ 2,000,000 and Above	
National Competitive Bidding for Goods	Between US\$ 100,001 and US\$ 1,999,999	
Shopping for Goods	Up to US\$ 100,000	
International Competitive Bidding for Works	US\$ 10,000,001 and Above	
National Competitive Bidding for Works	Between US\$ 100,001 and US\$ 9,999,999	
Shopping for Works	Up to US\$ 100,000	
Community Participation in Procurement for Works	Up to US\$ 50,000	

Consulting Services	
Method	Comments
Consultant's Qualification Selection for Consulting Firm	Prior Review.
Fixed Budget Selection for Consulting Firm	Prior Review.
Least-Cost Selection for Consulting Firm	Prior Review.
Quality- and Cost-Based Selection for Consulting Firm	Prior Review.
Quality-Based Selection for Consulting Firm	Prior Review.
Single Source Selection for Consulting Firm	Prior Review.
Individual Consultants Selection for Individual Consultant	Prior Review.

2. Goods and Works Contracts Estimated to Cost \$1 Million or More

The following table lists goods and works contracts for which the procurement activity is either ongoing or expected to commence within the next 18 months.

Package Number	General Description	Estimated Value	Procurement Method	Review (Prior/ Post)	Bidding Procedure	Advertisement Date (quarter/year)	Comments
Package 32	Supply of manure separating systems to treat livestock waste to produce material for organic fertiliser demonstration for Bac	1,340,909.00	NCB	Prior	1S1E	Q4 / 2016	Prequalification of Bidders: N Domestic Preference Applicable: N

	Giang, Ben Tre, Binh Dinh, and Phu Tho						Bidding Document: Goods
	Lot 1: Bac Giang	363,636.00					
	Lot 2: Ben Tre	227,273.00					
	Lot 3: Binh Dinh	204,545.00					
	Lot 4: Phu Tho	545,455.00					
Package 33	Supply of manure separating system to treat livestock waste to produce material for organic fertiliser demonstration for Ha Tinh, Nam Dinh, Soc Trang, Son La, and Tien Giang province	1,109,092.00	NCB	Post	1S1E	Q2 / 2017	Prequalification of Bidders: N Domestic Preference Applicable: N Bidding Document: Goods
	Lot 1: Ha Tinh	272,727.00					
	Lot 2: Nam Dinh	345,455.00					
	Lot 3: Soc Trang	36,364.00					
	Lot 4: Son La	227,273.00					
	Lot 5: Tien Giang	227,273.00					

3. Consulting Services Contracts Estimated to Cost \$100,000 or More

The following table lists consulting services contracts for which the recruitment activity is either ongoing or expected to commence within the next 18 months.

Package Number	General Description	Estimated Value	Recruitment Method	Review (Prior/Post)	Advertisement Date (quarter/year)	Type of Proposal	Comments
CS Package 24.	Biogas Value Chain (BVC) Physical Audit	100,000.00	FBS	Prior	Q4 / 2016	BTP	Assignment: National
Package 23.	Design, installation, monitoring and technological transferring for e-library system	250,000.00	FBS	Prior	Q3 / 2016	BTP	Assignment: National
Package 25.	Research on organic fertilizer production	1,200,000.00	QBS	Prior	Q3 / 2016	STP	Assignment: International

	from livestock waste and bio slurry by value chain						
Package 26.	Research on biogas technology improvement and effective biogas utilization by value chain	1,000,000.00	QBS	Prior	Q3 / 2016	STP	Assignment: International
Package 27.	Research on the water-saving pig farming technology	600,000.00	QCBS	Prior	Q3 / 2016	STP	Assignment: International Quality-Cost Ratio: 80:20
Package 28.	Research on effective utilization of crop waste by value chain	1,000,000.00	QCBS	Prior	Q3 / 2016	STP	Assignment: International Quality-Cost Ratio: 80:20
Package 29.	Research on the treatment of sludge sediment in shrimp farming	800,000.00	QCBS	Prior	Q3 / 2016	STP	Assignment: International Quality-Cost Ratio: 80:20
Package 31.	Project Auditing (Stage 2)	100,000.00	FBS	Prior	Q4 / 2016	BTP	Assignment: National

4. Goods and Works Contracts Estimated to Cost Less than \$1 Million and Consulting Services Contracts Less than \$100,000 (Smaller Value Contracts)

The following table lists smaller-value goods, works and consulting services contracts for which the activity is either ongoing or expected to commence within the next 18 months.

Goods and Works								
Package Number	General Description	Estimated Value	Number of Contracts	Procurement Method	Review (Prior/Post)	Bidding Procedure	Advertisement Date (quarter/year)	Comments
Package	Livestock	880,000.00	3	NCB	Prior	1S1E	Q2 / 2017	Prequalificati
14	environmental monitoring and biogas database management equipment Lot 1: Equipment for supporting biogas database management Lot 2: Provincial livestock environmental monitoring equipment Lot 3: Comprehensive livestock environmental monitoring equipment	140,000.00 340,000.00 400,000.00						on of Bidders: N Domestic Preference Applicable: N Bidding Document: Goods
Package 18.	Project Monitoring and Evaluation software for CPMU and 10 PPMUs	30,000.00	1	SHOPPING	Post		Q3 / 2017	
Package 22.	E-library equipment for sharing CSAWMP	360,000.00	1	NCB	Prior	1S1E	Q4 / 2017	Prequalificati on of Bidders: N Domestic Preference Applicable: N Bidding Document: Goods

Package 34	Supply of biogas generator and manure separating system for comprehensive management of livestock waste demonstration for Binh Dinh, Ha Tinh, Nam Dinh and Soc Trang province	322,727.00	4	NCB	Post	1S1E	Q2 / 2017	Prequalification of Bidders: N Domestic Preference Applicable: N Bidding Document: Goods
	Lot 1: Binh Dinh	68,182.00						
	Lot 2: Ha Tinh	90,909.00						
	Lot 3: Nam Dinh	109,091.00						
	Lot 4: Soc Trang	54,545.00						
Package 35	Supply of mobile manure separating system to treat livestock waste to produce material for organic fertilizer demonstration at household scale for Bac Giang, Ben Tre, Binh Dinh and Lao Cai province	477,272.00	4	NCB	Post	1S1E	Q2 / 2017	Prequalification of Bidders: N Domestic Preference Applicable: N Bidding Document: Goods
	Lot 1: Bac Giang	90,909.00						
	Lot 2: Ben Tre	90,909.00						
	Lot 3: Binh Dinh	113,636.00						
	Lot 4: Lao Cai	181,818.00						
Package 36	Supply of biogas generator system for demonstration of Binh Dinh, Ha Tinh, Lao Cai, Soc Trang and Tien Giang province	331,819.00	4	NCB	Post	1S1E	Q2 / 2017	Prequalification of Bidders: N Domestic Preference Applicable: N Bidding Document: Goods
	Lot 1: Binh Dinh	68,182.00						
	Lot 2: Lao Cai	136,364.00						
	Lot 3: Soc Trang	36,364.00						
	Lot 4: Tien Giang	90,909.00						

Package 37	Supply of utilisation system for treatment of biogas digested effluent demonstration as the fertiliser of the crops for Soc Trang and Binh Dinh province	204,545.00	2	NCB	Post	1S1E	Q3 / 2017	Prequalification of Bidders: N Domestic Preference Applicable: N Bidding Document: Goods
	Lot 1: Binh Dinh	90,909.00						
	Lot 2: Soc Trang	113,636.00						
Package 38	Supply of utilization system for treatment of cattle dung as the feedstock for red worm raising demonstration for Soc Trang province	77,273.00	1	SHOPPING	Post		Q3 / 2017	
Package 39	Supply of biogas generator system demonstration for fully utilization of flare gas of medium biogas plants	380,000.00	1	NCB	Post	1S1E	Q3 / 2017	Prequalification of Bidders: N Domestic Preference Applicable: N Bidding Document: Goods
Package 40.	Information dissemination on innovative and comprehensive solutions for livestock waste management	95,000.00	1	SHOPPING	Post		Q3 / 2017	
Package 41.	Information dissemination on credit line for agricultural waste management practices	95,000.00	1	SHOPPING	Post		Q3 / 2017	

Consulting Services

Package Number	General Description	Estimated Value	Number of Contracts	Recruitment Method	Review (Prior/ Post)	Advertisement Date (quarter/year)	Type of Proposal	Comments
CS Package 23	National Biogas Value Chain (BVC) Credit Market Specialist	11,500.00	1	ICS	Prior	Q3 / 2015		Assignment : National Expertise: Credit Market

CS Package 24	National Commercial Business Planner-Finance Specialist	29,500.00	1	ICS	Prior	Q3 / 2015		Assignment: National Expertise: Business Planning/Fin a nce Comments: 10 person- month assignment
---------------------	---	-----------	---	-----	-------	-----------	--	---

B. Indicative List of Packages Required Under the Project

The following table provides an indicative list of goods, works and consulting services contracts over the life of the project, other than those mentioned in previous sections (i.e., those expected beyond the current period).

Goods and Works							
Package Number	General Description	Estimated Value (cumulative)	Estimated Number of Contracts	Procurement Method	Review (Prior/Post)	Bidding Procedure	Comments
GD-EQPT1	Computer/Software	400,000.00	2	NCB	Prior	1S1E	Prequalification of Bidders: N Domestic Preference Applicable: N Bidding Document: Goods Comments: Need clearance from ADB prior to advertising of packages and/or award of any
	Lot 1:	200,000.00					contract to suppliers.
	Lot 2:	200,000.00					
GD-MEDIA	Dissemination/medias	810,000.00	10	SHOPPING	Post		Comments: Need clearance from ADB prior to advertising of packages.

Consulting Services							
Package Number	General Description	Estimated Value (cumulative)	Estimated Number of Contracts	Recruitment Method	Review (Prior/Post)	Type of Proposal	Comments
CON-CMD	Carbon Market Development Specialist	500,000.00	2	ICS	Prior	BTP	Assignment: National Expertise: Carbon Market Development Comments: The TORs will need clearance by ADB prior to any recruitment action for the packages.

CON-EVAL	Project Evaluation Consultants	100,000.00	2	ICS	Prior	BTP	Assignment: National Expertise: Project Evaluation Comments: The TORs will need clearance by ADB prior to any recruitment action for the packages.
----------	--------------------------------	------------	---	-----	-------	-----	--

C. List of Awarded and On-going, and Completed Contracts

The following tables list the awarded and on-going contracts, and completed contracts.

1. Awarded and Ongoing Contracts

Goods and Works							
Package Number	General Description	Estimated Value	Awarded Contract Value	Procurement Method	Advertisement Date (quarter/year)	Date of ADB Approval of Contract	Comments
						Award	
Package 8	Accounting Software	80,000.00	33,610.00	SHOPPING	Q1 / 2014	30-JUN-14	Post review
Package 20	Develop and Publish documents for CSAWMP	92,000.00	47,241.00	SHOPPING	Q4 / 2015	31-MAR-16	Post review
Package 13	Develop database management software system for biogas plants	90,000.00	86,729.00	SHOPPING	Q4 / 2015	31-MAR-16	Post review
Package 12	Produce and publish documentary films on utilization of agricultural waste to producing bio-energy, organic fertilizer; and environment protection measures in agriculture production	95,000.00	66,078.00	SHOPPING	Q4 / 2015	31-MAR-16	Post review
Package 19	Upgrading map sets for seven agro-ecological regions to forecast potentiality and current situation of agricultural waste used for producing renewable energy and organic fertilizers (to include support for agricultural waste management planning)	90,000.00	88,616.00	SHOPPING	Q4 / 2015	31-MAY-16	Post review

Package 22	Vehicle for Phu Tho Province	50,000.00	45,455.00	SHOPPING	Q4 / 2015	31-MAR-16	Post review
------------	------------------------------	-----------	-----------	----------	-----------	-----------	-------------

Consulting Services							
Package Number	General Description	Estimated Value	Awarded Contract Value	Recruitment Method	Advertisement Date (quarter/year)	Date of ADB Approval of Contract Award	Comments
Package 3	Baseline Survey	146,080.00	130,800.00	FBS	Q1 / 2015	28-JAN-16	
Package 4	Project Auditing	125,000.00	44,797.00	LCS	Q3 / 2014	03-SEP-15	UHY ACA Auditing and Consulting Company Limited
Package 1	Project Management Consulting Services	2,417,000.00	2,185,018.00	QBS	Q2 / 2014	04-NOV-15	
Package 5a	Project Start-up Support Consultants	150,000.00	59,543.00	ICS	Q4 / 2013	17-MAR-14	3 separate consulting contracts awarded.
CS Package 9	Start-Up Consultant	80,000.00	79,332.00	ICS	Q2 / 2014	06-JUL-15	Mr. Lindsay Saunders
CS Package 6	Start-Up Consultant	60,000.00	26,323.00	ICS	Q4 / 2013	29-APR-14	Mdm. Le thi Thoa
CS Package 7	Start-Up Consultant	10,000.00	7,905.00	ICS	Q4 / 2013	17-MAR-14	Mr. Nguyen Dinh Vinh
CS	Start-Up	30,000.00	21,005.00	ICS	Q4 / 2013	17-MAR-14	Mdm. Le Thi
Package 8	Consultant						Nhung

D. National Competitive Bidding

1. General

The procedures to be followed for the procurement of goods, non-consulting services, and works under contracts awarded on the basis of National Competitive Bidding shall be those set forth in: (a) Law on Procurement No. 43/2013/QH13 dated November 26, 2013 ("Law on Procurement") and (b) Decree No. 63/2014/ND-CP dated June 26, 2014 (collectively, "National Procurement Laws"). Whenever any procedure in the National Procurement Laws is inconsistent with the ADB Procurement Guidelines (March 2013, as amended from time to time), the ADB Procurement Guidelines shall prevail, amongst others on the following.

2. Eligibility

- (i) The eligibility of bidders shall be defined under section I of the ADB Procurement Guidelines; accordingly, no bidder or potential bidder should be declared ineligible for reasons other than those provided in section I of the ADB Procurement Guidelines, as amended from time to time. Conditions of bidders' participation shall be limited to those that are essential to ensure bidders' capability to fulfill the contract in question. Foreign bidders shall be eligible to participate under the same conditions as national bidders. Foreign bidders shall not be asked or required to form joint ventures with, or be subcontractors to, national bidders in order to submit a bid.
- (ii) A firm declared ineligible by ADB cannot participate in bidding for an ADB-financed contract during the period of time determined by ADB.
- (iii) A bidder shall not have a conflict of interest, which term shall be defined in accordance with section 1 of ADB Procurement Guidelines.¹ Any bidder found to have a conflict of interest shall be ineligible for contract award.
- (iv) Government-owned enterprises in the Borrower's country shall be eligible to participate as a bidder only if they can establish that they are legally and financially autonomous, operate under commercial law and are not dependent agencies of the Borrower or Sub-Borrower.
- (v) National sanction lists may only be applied with approval of ADB².

3. Preferences

No preference of any kind shall be given to domestic bidders over foreign bidders or for domestically manufactured goods over foreign manufactured goods. Unless otherwise stated in the applicable financing agreement, preferences among domestic bidders set forth in Article 14(3) of the Law on Procurement shall not be applied.

¹ Detailed guidance on how to apply conflict of interest test is available under section 1 of ADB's standard bidding documents for goods and works (as amended from time to time).

² For fraud and corruption cases, Section 50 of ADB's Integrity Principles and Guidelines provides that ADB may decide that another international financial institution's or legal or regulatory body's determination that a party has failed to adhere to appropriate ethical standards, as defined by any established system of principles, rules, or duties, including the laws or regulations of a state, constitutes that party's failure to maintain the highest ethical standards as required by ADB's Anticorruption Policy. The party may be subject to remedial action in accordance with the Integrity Principles and Guidelines. <http://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/integrity-principles-guidelines.pdf>

4. Bidding Procedure

Single stage-single envelope shall be the default bidding procedure and application of other bidding procedures shall require ADB's prior approval.

5. Time for Bid Preparation

The time allowed for the preparation and submission of bids for large and/or complex packages shall not be less than thirty (30) days from the date of the invitation to bid or the date of availability of the bidding documents, whichever is later.

6. Standard bidding documents

The Borrower's standard bidding documents, acceptable to ADB, shall be used. Bidders shall be allowed to submit bids by hand or by mail/ courier.

7. Bid Opening and Evaluation

- (i) Bids shall be opened in public, immediately after the deadline for submission of bids, regardless of the number of bids received.
- (ii) Except with prior approval of ADB, merit points shall not be used in bid evaluation.
- (iii) No price adjustments shall be made for evaluation purposes in accordance with Article 117(6) of Decree 63 when unit rates offered by the bidder are determined to be abnormally low.
- (iv) Bidders shall be given commercially reasonable time period to respond to clarification requests.
- (v) Bidders shall not be eliminated from detailed evaluation on the basis of minor, non-substantial deviations³.
- (vi) Except with the prior approval of ADB, negotiations contemplated under paragraphs 7 and 8 of Article 117 of Decree No. 63/2014/ND-CP shall not take place with any bidder prior to contract award.
- (vii) A bidder shall not be required, as a condition for award of contract, to undertake obligations not specified in the bidding documents or otherwise to modify the bid as originally submitted.

8. Rejection of All Bids and Rebidding

- (i) No bid shall be rejected on the basis of a comparison with the Procuring Entity's estimate or budget ceiling without ADB's prior concurrence.
- (ii) All bids shall not be rejected and new bids solicited without ADB's prior approval.

³ A minor, non-substantial deviation is one that, if accepted, would not affect in any substantial way the scope, quality, or performance specified in the contract; or limit in any substantial way, the Contracting entity rights or the Bidder's obligations under the proposed contract or if rectified, would not unfairly affect the competitive position of other bidders presenting substantially responsive bids.

9. Publication of the Award of Contract. Debriefing.

- (i) For contracts subject to prior review, within 2 weeks of receiving ADB's "No—objection to the recommendation of contract award, the borrower shall publish in the Government Public Procurement Gazette, or well-known and freely-accessible website the results of the bid evaluation, identifying the bid and lot numbers, and providing information on: i) name of each bidder who submitted a bid; ii) bid prices as read out at bid opening; iii) name and evaluated prices of each bid that was evaluated; iv) name of bidders whose bids were rejected and the reasons for their rejection; and v) name of the winning bidder, and the price it offered, as well as the duration and summary scope of the contract awarded.
- (ii) For contracts subject to post review, the procuring entity shall publish the bid evaluation results no later than the date of contract award.
- (iii) In the publication of the bid evaluation results, the Borrower shall specify that any bidder who wishes to ascertain the grounds on which its bid was not selected, may request an explanation from the Borrower. The Borrower shall promptly provide an explanation of why such bid was not selected, either in writing and/or in a debriefing meeting, at the option of the Borrower. The requesting bidder shall bear all the costs of attending such a debriefing.

10. Contract Administration

The Contract Agreement, as such term is defined in the relevant bidding document, shall be applied without any modification during implementation except as otherwise agreed by ADB.

11. Fraud and Corruption

A provision shall be included in all bidding documents for NCB works and goods contracts financed by ADB stating that ADB will sanction a party or its related parties, including declaring ineligible, either indefinitely or for a stated period of time, to participate in ADB-financed, administered or supported activities if it at any time determines that the party has, directly or indirectly through an agent, engaged in integrity violations as defined under ADB's Integrity Principles and Guidelines, including corrupt, fraudulent, collusive, or coercive practices in competing for, or in executing, an ADB-financed, administered or supported contract.

12. Right to Inspect/ Audit

Each bidding document and contract financed by ADB shall include a provision requiring bidders, contractors, agents (whether declared or not), sub-contractors, sub-consultants, service providers, or suppliers and any personnel thereof, to permit ADB to inspect all accounts, records and other documents relating to any prequalification process, bid submission, and contract performance (in the case of award), and to have them audited by auditors appointed by ADB.

Loan 2968-VIE: Low carbon Agricultural Support Project
Overall Projected Contract Award Schedule for ADB Loan

No.	CPMU/Province	ADB Loan Estimated (VND mil.)	Cum. Con. Awards As 3/31/2017	Contract Award Projections (VND mil.)										Contracted Ratio %
				2017			2018				2019			
				Q II	Q III	Q IV	Q I	Q II	Q III	Q IV	Q I	Q II	Q III	
*	CPMU	336,054	98,201	1,443	6,818	125,600	2,182	54,273	18,449	26,203	1,443	1,445	0	29%
1	Binh Dinh	67,585	31,188	2,642	5,917	6,017	3,938	6,588	6,450	3,857	490	498	0	46%
2	Bac Giang	56,877	27,129	589	661	4,091	1,278	10,262	4,262	7,392	780	433	0	48%
3	Ben Tre	37,125	18,171	2,298	3,800	3,252	1,797	3,929	2,013	1,485	190	190	0	49%
4	Ha Tinh	41,502	22,043	2,410	2,297	4,155	1,596	4,318	1,239	2,442	586	416	0	53%
5	Lao Cai	35,286	13,794	1,849	1,309	3,283	2,255	5,768	2,030	3,430	968	600	0	39%
6	Nam Dinh	54,222	20,073	1,254	1,090	4,020	4,902	9,909	4,802	6,852	1,097	223	0	37%
7	Phu Tho	74,718	36,414	4,957	4,473	8,552	2,811	8,587	2,912	4,791	791	430	0	49%
8	Soc Trang	36,969	11,777	1,379	1,865	3,839	2,601	6,174	2,675	4,003	2,297	358	0	32%
9	Son La	28,819	8,884	1,835	1,564	3,475	2,236	4,326	2,236	3,340	546	374	0	31%
10	Tien Giang	31,006	10,752	1,383	3,352	1,124	1,841	5,339	1,839	3,239	1,840	297	0	35%
Total in VND mil.		800,163	298,426	22,039	33,146	167,408	27,437	119,473	48,907	67,034	11,028	5,264	0	37%
Total in USD mil.		35.893	13.387	0.989	1.487	7.509	1.231	5.359	2.194	3.007	0.495	0.236	0.000	37%
Credit lines in USD mil.		29.8	0.9	0.0	4.8	4.8	4.8	4.8	4.8	4.8	0.1			
Total in USD mil.		65.720	14.325	0.989	6.287	12.309	6.030	10.159	6.994	7.807	0.584	0.236	0.000	

APPENDIX 5: PROJECT SPECIFIC COVENANTS - AS DISPLAYED IN LEGAL AGREEMENTS

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Article 4	1	(b) In the carrying out of the Project and operation of the Project facilities, the Borrower shall perform, or cause to be performed, all the obligations set forth in Schedule 5 to this Loan Agreement and the Project Agreement	Being complied with.	Others
Loan 2968	Article 4	1	(a) The Borrower shall cause the FIs to carry out the Project with due diligence and efficiency and in conformity with sound applicable technical, financial, business and development practices.	Being complied with	Financials
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	1	The Borrower shall ensure that the Project is implemented in accordance with the detailed arrangements set forth in the PAM. Any subsequent change to the PAM shall become effective only after approval of such change by the Borrower and ADB. In the event of any discrepancy between the PAM and the Loan Agreement, the provisions of the Loan Agreement shall prevail.	Being complied with.	Others
Loan 2968	Article 3	1	The Borrower shall cause the proceeds of the Loan to be applied to the financing of expenditures on the Project in accordance with the provisions of this Loan Agreement and the Project Agreement.	Being complied with.	Financials
Loan 2968	Article 3	2	The Borrower shall enter into a Subsidiary Loan Agreement with each FI, providing inter alia for the relending of part of the proceeds of the Loan not exceeding twenty-three million two hundred and thirty-nine thousand Special Drawing Rights (SDR23,239,000) in aggregate to all FIs, the carrying out by the FIs of the Project activities described in Part 2 of paragraph 2 of Schedule 1 to the Loan Agreement, and the rights of the Borrower and ADB with respect thereto. Such Subsidiary Loan Agreements shall contain terms and conditions acceptable to ADS, and shall be without prejudice to, and without limitation on, the obligations of the Borrower under the Loan Agreement.	Complied with.	Financials

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Article 4	2	<p>(a) The Borrower shall (i) maintain separate accounts and records for the Project; (ii) prepare annual financial statements for the Project in accordance with accounting principles acceptable to ADB; (iii) have such financial statements audited annually by independent auditors whose qualifications, experience and terms of reference are acceptable to ADB, in accordance with international standards for auditing or the national equivalent acceptable to ADB; (iv) as part of each such audit, have the auditors prepare a report (which includes the auditors' opinion on the use of the Loan proceeds and compliance with the financial covenants of this Loan Agreement as well as on the use of the procedures for the imprest fund and statement of expenditures) and a management letter (which sets out the deficiencies in the internal control of the Project that were identified in the course of the audit, if any); and (v) furnish to ADB, no later than 6 months after the end of each related fiscal year, copies of such audited financial statements, audit report and management letter, all in the English language, and such other information concerning these documents and the audit thereof as ADS shall from time to time reasonably request.</p>	Being complied with	Financials
			<p>(b) ADB shall disclose the annual audited financial statements for the Project within 30 days of the date of their receipt by posting them on ADB's website.</p>	On going.	
			<p>(c) The Borrower shall enable ADB, upon ADB's request, to discuss the financial statements for the Project and the Borrower's financial affairs where they relate to the Project with the auditors appointed pursuant to subsection (a)(iii) hereinabove, and shall authorize and require any representative of such auditors to participate in any such discussions requested by ADB. This is provided that such discussions shall be conducted only in the presence of an authorized officer of the Borrower, unless the Borrower shall otherwise agree.</p>	Being complied with.	

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	2	(a) Within 12 months of the date of effectiveness of the Loan Agreement, the Borrower shall submit written evidence satisfactory to ADB showing that a TSU has been established under the CPMU to undertake Project-advisory activities as described in the PAM.	Complied with	Others
			(b) The evidence to be delivered under paragraph (a) above shall: (i) provide the names of counterpart staff from the government agencies specified in the PAM who together will comprise the TSU; and (ii) provide the name of the head of the TSU, who shall be determined during Project implementation	Complied with	
			(c) The Borrower shall ensure or cause CPMU to ensure that no amount is deposited into the TSU's sub-account unless and until the Borrower has complied with paragraphs (a) and (b) above and the terms of reference for each member of the TSU have been agreed with ADB. Such terms of reference shall reflect the purely technical and advisory role of the TSU and shall not include any activities related to Project management or implementation, which shall be undertaken by the Project Executing Agency and IAs only.	Complied with.	
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	3	The Borrower shall ensure that each Subsidiary Loan, unless otherwise agreed by ADB: (i) is denominated in Dong; (ii) has a maturity, grace period and interest rate to be determined by the Borrower in accordance with the Borrower's lending practices applicable to the onlending of funds externally borrowed by the Borrower; and (iii) is made under such other terms and conditions acceptable to ADB.	Complied with.	Financials
Loan 2968	Article 3	4	The Borrower shall cause the FIs to onlend the proceeds of the Subsidiary Loans to Eligible Beneficiaries under Subloan Agreements, under Part 2 of paragraph 2 of Schedule 1 to the Loan Agreement and in accordance with the provisions of the Loan Agreement.	Being complied with	Financials

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Article 4	3	In addition to the reports and information set forth in Section 6.05 of the Loan Regulations, the Borrower shall furnish, or cause to be furnished, to ADB all such reports and information as ADB shall reasonably request concerning (a) the Eligible Beneficiaries, the Eligible Subprojects and the Subloans; and (b) the administration, operations and financial condition of each FI.	Being complied with	Financials
Loan 2968	Article 4	4	The Borrower shall enable ADB's representatives to inspect the Project, the Goods and Works, any Eligible Beneficiary, any Eligible Subproject, and any relevant records and documents.	Being complied with.	Others
Loan 2968	Article 3	5	The proceeds of the Loan shall be allocated and withdrawn in accordance with the provisions of Schedule 3 to the Loan Agreement, as such Schedule may be amended from time to time by agreement between the Borrower and ADB.	Being complied with.	Financials
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	4	For each Biogas Value Chain Infrastructure construction project to be financed by a Subloan under Part 2 of paragraph 2 of Schedule 1 to the Loan Agreement, the Borrower shall cause the relevant FI to ensure that: (i) such Subloan is made only to Eligible Beneficiaries for Eligible Subprojects; (ii) the Biogas Plant is constructed by certified masons or contractors who will certify compliance with the relevant technical and environmental standards specified in the Subproject Eligibility Criteria; and (iii) the Subproject Eligibility Criteria is incorporated into each FI's standard loan eligibility criteria to ensure the targeted clients under the Project is reached and the Project objectives are achieved.	Being complied with	Financials
Loan 2968	Article 3	3	Except as ADB may otherwise agree, the proceeds of the Subsidiary Loans shall be used only for making Subloans to Eligible Beneficiaries for Eligible Subprojects and shall be applied exclusively to the cost of Goods and Works and other items of expenditure required to carry out such Eligible Subprojects.	Being complied with.	Financials

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Article 4	5	The Borrower shall promptly take all action, including the provision of funds, facilities, services and other resources, which shall be necessary on its part to enable the FIs to perform their respective obligations under the Project Agreement, and shall not take or permit any action which would interfere with the performance of such obligations.	Being complied with.	Financials
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	5	For each medium and each large Biogas Value Chain Infrastructure construction project to be financed by a Subloan under Part 2 of paragraph 2 of Schedule 1 to the Loan Agreement, the Borrower shall prioritize construction of such plant in a CLZ (if any).	Complied with	Others

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	6	The Borrower shall ensure that: (i) the FIs together provide counterpart financing in an amount not less than \$6,300,000 in aggregate to finance the Project activities described in Part 2 of paragraph 2 of Schedule 1 to the Loan Agreement; (ii) for each Subloan, a maximum of 85% of the original principal amount of that Subloan is financed from a Subsidiary Loan, a minimum of 15% is financed from the relevant FI's own funds and the recipient borrower of the Subloan shall be contributed in-kind including by providing available local materials and/or labor of equivalent value; (iii) each Subloan has an interest rate as agreed by MOF and the FI concerned as set out in the relevant Subsidiary Loan Agreement; (iv) the interest rate for each Subloan is determined based on market interest rates; and (v) each Subloan has such other terms and conditions as required in the Guidelines for Biogas Value Chains and any other terms and conditions as the relevant FI may have in extending loans to customers from time to time in the ordinary course of its business. In determining the applicable interest rate and other terms and conditions for a Subloan, the Borrower and the FIs shall take into consideration, and hence ensure, that Eligible Beneficiaries have access to affordable financial sources for construction of Biogas Plants and the Borrower shall ensure or cause the FIs to ensure that no amendments, waivers, supplements or other modifications are made to the terms and conditions of any Subloan which would jeopardize this principle.	Being complied with.	Financials
Loan 2968	Article 3	6	Except as ADB may otherwise agree, the Borrower shall procure, or cause to be procured, the items of expenditure to be financed out of the proceeds of the Loan in accordance with the provisions of Schedule 4 to the Loan Agreement.	Being complied with.	Others
Loan 2968	Article 4	6	(a) The Borrower shall exercise its rights under the Subsidiary Loan Agreements in such a manner as to protect the interests of the Borrower and ADB and to accomplish the purposes of the Loan.	Being complied with.	Financials

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
			(b) No rights or obligations under the Subsidiary Loan Agreements shall be assigned, amended, abrogated or waived without the prior concurrence of ADB.	Being complied with.	
Loan 2968	Article 3	7	Withdrawals from the Loan Account in respect of Goods, Works and Consulting Services shall be made only on account of expenditures relating to:		Others
			(a) Goods which are produced in and supplied from, and Works and Consulting Services which are supplied from such member countries of ADB as shall have been specified by ADS from time to time as eligible sources for procurement; and	Being complied with.	
			(b) Goods, Works and Consulting Services which meet such other eligibility requirements as shall have been specified by ADB from time to time.	Being complied with.	
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	7	The Borrower shall allocate a fund to Eligible Beneficiaries as a financial incentive to carry out Eligible Subprojects and supporting carbon market development. Such allocation shall be done in accordance with the PAM.	Being complied with.	Others
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	8	In respect of an Eligible Subproject, the Borrower shall ensure or cause the CPMU, PPMUs and FIs to ensure that allocated funds are not credited to the accounts of the relevant Eligible Beneficiaries until the PPMU associated with that Eligible Subproject has confirmed to the relevant FI and ADB following due investigation and physical inspection and such certifications as required under paragraph 4(ii) above, that such Eligible Subproject and certification has complied with all technical, engineering, construction, environmental and other requirements and safeguards set out in the Subproject Eligibility Criteria	Being complied with.	Others
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	9	The Borrower shall ensure or cause the CPMU, PPMUs and FIs to ensure that the Subproject Eligibility Criteria is not amended, supplemented, waived, deferred or otherwise modified in any way without the prior consent of ADB.	Being complied with.	Others

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	10	The Borrower shall ensure that the portfolio of Subloans shall be accounted for and reported separately by the FIs in such form and at such frequency as may be required by ADB.	Being complied with.	Financials
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	11	The Borrower shall immediately notify ADB if at any time it receives information from an FI that: (i) the percentage of non-performing Subloans financed by that FI is likely to exceed 5% of the aggregate outstanding amount of all Subloans financed by that FI at that time; and (ii) the percentage of non-performing Subloans financed by that FI is likely to exceed 10% of the aggregate outstanding amount of all Subloans financed by that FI at that time (the "NPL Limit"). If, at any time, it receives information from an FI that the NPL Limit has been exceeded, until further notice given by ADB, the Borrower shall immediately cease processing any current or pending withdrawal applications for Subsidiary Loans to that FI and shall temporarily suspend all further disbursements under Subsidiary Loans to that FI	Being complied with.	Financials
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	12	The Borrower shall ensure or cause the FIs to ensure that none of the Subprojects involve any environmental, involuntary resettlement impacts or impacts on indigenous peoples or ethnic minority groups which can be categorized as Category A, all within the meaning of the Safeguard Policy Statement.	Being complied with.	Safeguards
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	13	The Borrower shall ensure that: (i) the Project does not have any involuntary resettlement impacts within the meaning of the Safeguard Policy Statement; and (ii) the site selected for any Subproject shall be situated on land already owned by the Eligible Beneficiary thereby ensuring that the Subproject will not entail any land acquisition. In the event that the Project does have any such involuntary resettlement impacts, the Borrower shall take all steps required to ensure that the Project complies with the applicable laws and regulations of the Borrower and with the Safeguard Policy Statement.	Being complied with.	Safeguards

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	14	The Borrower shall ensure or cause the FIs to ensure that the preparation, design, construction, implementation, operation and decommissioning of each Eligible Subproject and all Project facilities comply with: (i) all applicable laws and regulations of the Borrower relating to environment, health, and safety; (ii) the Environmental Safeguards; (iii) the EARF; and (iv) all measures and requirements set forth in the respective IEE and EMP and any corrective or preventative actions set forth in a Environmental Monitoring Report.	Being complied with.	Safeguards
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	15	The Borrower shall ensure or cause the FIs to ensure that the preparation, design, construction, implementation and operation of each Eligible Subproject complies with (i) all applicable laws and regulations of the Borrower relating to ethnic minorities; (ii) the Indigenous Peoples Safeguards; and (iii) all measures and requirements set forth in the EMDP, and any corrective or preventative actions set forth in an Environmental Monitoring Report.	Being complied with.	Safeguards
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	16	The Borrower shall ensure that the EMDP prepared for the Project and agreed with ADB is updated and fully implemented in a timely manner, and that adequate resources are allocated for this purpose.	Being complied with.	Safeguards
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	17	The Borrower shall do the following or cause the FIs to do the following:		Safeguards
			(a) submit semi-annual Environmental Monitoring Reports to ADB;	Being complied with.	
			(b) if any unanticipated environmental and/or social risks and impacts arise during Eligible Subproject implementation promptly inform ADB of the occurrence of such risks or impacts, with detailed description of the event and proposed corrective action plan; and	Being complied with.	
(c) report any actual or potential breach of compliance with the measures and requirements set forth in the EARF and any EMP or EMDP promptly after becoming aware of the breach.	Being complied with.				

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	18	The Borrower shall cause the Project Executing Agency to ensure that: (i) the contracts for relevant Works contain provisions prohibiting use of child: labor and differentiation in wages between male and female workers for work of equal value, in accordance with the relevant laws and regulations of the Borrower; (ii) such contracts also include mandatory provisions on health, sanitation and appropriate working conditions; and (iii) contractors and their workers observe local protocols concerning acceptable behavior towards the local population.	Being complied with.	Social

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	19	<p>The Borrower shall ensure that the gender action plan prepared for the Project and agreed with ADB is fully implemented in a timely manner and that adequate resources are allocated for this purpose. The gender action plan for the Project ensures that (i) at least 20% of those who are trained in biogas management and technical issues are women; (ii) at least 20% of those who are trained and certified as masons for the construction of small Biogas Plants are women and at least 80% of these women shall find employment; (iii) at least 50% of those trained on utilization of biogas technology and operation and maintenance are women; (iv) at least 50% of those who are trained on farm management and waste management on farms are women; (v) at least 30% of employees trained in medium Biogas Plants and large Biogas Plants are women; (vi) at least 50% of recipients of Subloans from FIs will be registered under husband-wife joint accounts or on behalf of women; (vii) at least 50% of official registration of all purchased biogas units and plants under the Project will be under husband-wife joint accounts or on behalf of women; (viii) 30% of research topics undertaken under Part 3 of paragraph 2 of Schedule 1 to the Loan Agreement relate to gender issues associated with Biogas Plants; (ix) at least 40% of those selected as champions of smart-agriculture in research and dissemination of CSAWMP technology are women; (x) training materials of CSAWMP technology and methodology of dissemination will be women-friendly and at least 50% of dissemination events and consultations will involve women-only groups; (xi) a sex-disaggregated and ethnic minority data base is established as part of the Project's project performance and monitoring system established by the CPMU; (xii) 30% of staff in the CPMU and PPMUs are women and that the CPMU and each PPMU has a gender focal point; and (xiii) gender indicators are included in the overall monitoring and evaluation framework for the Project.</p>	<p>Being complied with (except for : (viii) : not yet due; (xii) and (xiii) : complied with; (v) and (x) : partially complied with</p>	Social

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	20	The Borrower shall ensure that in all Project Provinces, information dissemination, education and mass -communication activities are carried out in a timely manner to promote the replication of biogas technology application and utilization.	On going.	Social
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	21	The Borrower shall ensure or cause the FIs to ensure that no proceeds of the Loan are used to finance any activity included in the list of prohibited investment activities provided in Appendix 5 of the Safeguard Policy Statement.	Being complied with.	Others
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	22	The Borrower shall comply with, and shall cause the Project Executing Agency, the TSU and each IA to comply with ADB's Anticorruption Policy (1998, as amended to date). The Borrower: (i) acknowledges that ADB reserves the right to investigate directly, or through its agents, any alleged corrupt, fraudulent, collusive or coercive practice relating to the Project; and (ii) agrees to cooperate with, and to cause the Project Executing Agency, the TSU and each IA to cooperate fully with any such investigation and extend all necessary assistance, including providing access to all relevant books and records, as may be necessary for satisfactory completion of such investigation and shall allow, and cause the Project Executing Agency, the TSU and each IA to allow, ADB to investigate any violation or potential violation of these undertakings.	Being complied with.	Others
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	23	Without limiting the generality of the preceding paragraphs, the Borrower shall: (i) ensure that the Project Executing Agency and each IA conduct periodic inspections on the contractors' activities related to fund withdrawals and settlements; and (ii) ensure and cause the Project Executing Agency and each IA to ensure that all bidding documents and contracts financed by ADB in connection with the Project include anticorruption provisions acceptable to ADB including provisions specifying the right of ADB to audit and examine the records and accounts of the contractors, suppliers, consultants, and other service providers as they relate to the Project.	Being complied with.	Others

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	24	<p>If the Borrower or ADB is or becomes aware or has a reasonable suspicion that any member of the Project Executing Agency, TSU or any IA has engaged in corrupt or fraudulent practices (as defined in ADB's Anticorruption Policy (1998 as amended to date)) under or in connection with the Project or the Loan, the Borrower shall take such timely and appropriate action satisfactory to ADB to investigate and/or remedy the situation, including in the case of corrupt or fraudulent practices of an FI, demanding immediate repayment or otherwise recovering any portion of the relevant Subsidiary Loan, with such repayment or recovery to be promptly paid to ADB in prepayment of the Loan. If the Borrower does not undertake investigative and/or remedial action to the satisfaction of ADB, without prejudice to any other rights contained in this Loan Agreement, ADB may declare the relevant FI ineligible, either indefinitely or for a stated period, to be considered as a provider of financial intermediary loans or any other financial instruments for future ADB projects.</p>	<p>Being complied with.</p>	Others

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	25	In addition to these requirements, to deter corruption and increase transparency, the Borrower shall create a Project website within 5 months of the Effective Date, accessible by the general public, to disclose various information concerning the Project including general information about the Project, public procurements related to the Project, Project progress and contact details in English and Vietnamese languages. The website shall also provide a link to ADB's Integrity Unit (http://www.adb.org/Integrity/complaint.asp) for reporting to ADB any grievances or allegations of corrupt practices arising out of the Project and Project activities. For each contract, the website shall include information on, among others, the list of participating bidders, name of the winning bidder, basic details on bidding procedures adopted, amount of contract awarded, and the list of goods/services, including consulting services, procured. The Borrower shall cause the Project Executing Agency to permit any bidder to request an explanation as to why a bid was unsuccessful and either the Project Executing Agency shall respond within 20 working days. The website will be updated promptly and regularly after each award of contract, (ii) each submission of the semi-annual Environmental Monitoring Report to ADB. In addition to the web-based disclosure, stakeholders, which include civil society and non-governmental organizations, shall be provided by the Borrower with detailed information on procurement on public notice boards in their	Being complied with.	Others
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	26	The Borrower shall and shall ensure that the Project Executing Agency and each IA complies with: (i) ADB's policy relating to Enhancing the Asian Development Bank's Role in Combating Money Laundering and the Financing of Terrorism (2003); and (ii) applicable laws and regulations of the Borrower on combating money laundering and financing of terrorism and that Loan proceeds are not used, directly or indirectly, in money laundering or financing of terrorism.	Being complied with.	Others

Product	Schedule	No.	Description	Remarks/Issues	Type
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	27	The Borrower shall ensure that each FI formulates and implements internal control procedures, including customer due diligence procedures, to prevent violation of paragraph 26 above.	Being complied with.	Others
Loan 2968	Schedule 5	28	The Borrower shall and shall ensure that each FI promptly informs the Borrower and ADB if there is any violation or potential violation of paragraph 26 above. In the event that ADB informs an FI of its concern that there has been such an alleged violation, that FI shall: (i) cooperate in good faith with ADB and its representatives so that ADB can determine whether such a violation has occurred; (ii) respond promptly and in reasonable detail to any query from ADB; and (iii) furnish documentary support for such response upon ADB's request.	Being complied with.	Others

APPENDIX 6: UPDATED ETHNIC MINORITIES DEVELOPMENT PLAN
As of 31 March 2017

No.	Activities	Status	Achievements
1	Livestock waste management		
1.1	<i>Biogas plant value chain management</i>		
1.1.1	Map EM statistic in sample provinces, their livelihoods and potential links to BP value chains.	On-going	<p><u>Quarter 1-2017</u>: The number of BPs input into the database is 3,166, including 2,267 BPs with ethnic minorities:</p> <p>-Lao Cai: 3</p> <p>-Phu Thọ: 962</p> <p>-Ha Tinh: 879</p> <p>-Soc Trang: 423</p> <p><u>As of Quarter 1, 2017</u> the database for BPs under Package 13, with separate data for ethnic minorities, has been implemented and updated with 31,772 BPs of the whole project. Of which, the provinces with ethnic minorities has updated 22,974 BPs.</p>
1.1.2	Assess resources and constraints for EMs to construct BPs	Ongoing	<p>Assessment during implementation phase has been initially done through the consultation with provinces in November 2016.</p> <p>To be continue Assess resources and constraints for EMs to construct BPs in the future</p>
1.1.3	Construction of SBPs for EMs	Ongoing	<p><u>Quarter 1-2017</u></p> <p>There are 4 provinces with newly constructed small scale biogas plants: 1652, of which ethnic minorities are 89, accounting for 5.4%. Detailed data:</p> <p><u>Lào Cai</u>: 62/225=28%</p> <p>Phú Thọ: 0/916=0%</p> <p>Bình Định: 0/344=0%</p> <p>Sóc Trăng: 27/167=16,2%</p> <p><u>Cumulative data as of Quarter 1-2017</u>, The Project has provided 45,869 SBPs, of which 3.135 SBPs are provided for ethnic minorities in 7 selected provinces (Accounting for 6.8 % of the total number of SBPs in 10 project provinces).</p>
1.1.4	Organize to potentially share BP	Ongoing	<u>Quarter 1-2017</u> , only 1 province implemented some activities:

No.	Activities	Status	Achievements
	value chain benefits from BP owners to EMs		<p>Bắc Giang:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of articles: 50 - Number of video clips: 6 <p>The project has organized various communication activities to disseminate information about the project including the proposals for sharing Biogas Value Chain (BVC) benefits (energy and organic fertilizer) from BP owners.</p> <p><u>As of Quarter 1, 2017</u> the communication activities in the 10 provinces are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 431 information dissemination meetings and workshops - 101 articles broadcast on TV - 4,436 articles broadcast on radio - 123 articles on newspapers - 4,641 bulletin boards - 19,500 posters - 130,000 leaflets - 25 video clips - 100 handbook - 300 panels - 3,748 banners
1.1.5	Monitor BP value chain management within EMs	Ongoing	<p><u>Quarter 1-2017</u> 2 provinces have constructed 89 BPs for the EMs, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lao Cai: 62 Soc Trang: 27 <p><u>As of Quarter 1-2017:</u> All the 10 provinces have constructed 45,869 BPs, including 3,135 SBPs for EMs, receiving the supervision and technical assistance from the project in terms of BVC management.</p>
1.2 Carbon market access			
1.2.1	Assess EM driven investments that may link carbon emission	Ongoing	All data on biogas plants of ethnic minorities will be provided to the National Biogas Program to support carbon credit program

No.	Activities	Status	Achievements
			<i>Cumulative data as of Quarter 1-2017</i> , The Project has provided 45,869 SBPs, of which 3.135 SBPs are provided for ethnic minorities in 5 EMs provinces (Accounting for 6.8% of the total number of SBPs in 10 project provinces).
1.2.2	Train EMs on CSAWMP linked to carbon markets	Ongoing	<p><i>Quarter 1-2017</i>: No activities carried out in the provinces with EMs. 580 people from the provinces without EMs have been trained.</p> <p><i>Cumulative data as of Quarter 1-2017</i>: 8,397 people from the 10 project provinces have been trained on CSAWMP, of which 1,220 are ethnic minorities, accounting for 14.53%</p> <p><i>Considering the 7 provinces with EMs only, the number of trained EM accounts for 22.8% (1,220/5,355)</i></p>
1.2.3	Assess FIs which are suitable for EM to access the credit		<p><i>Quarter 1-2017</i>: There have been credit activities in 3 provinces: 394 households, of which 148 are ethnic households, accounting for 39%</p> <p>-Lao Cai: 143/214= 66.8%</p> <p>- Bac Giang: 5/129=3.9%</p> <p>- Binh Dinh: 0/51 =0%</p> <p>Disbursement rate of the two FIs including BARD and the Bank for Cooperatives is very slow and inefficient.</p> <p><i>As of Quarter 1-2017</i>, the cumulative number of ethnic households is 268 (out of the total of 729 households receiving credits) accounting for 36.8 %.</p> <p>No EM households borrowing credits</p>
1.3	<i>Biogas value chains sustainability</i>		
1.3.1	Train EMs to manage their livestock and wastes	Ongoing	The project has provided training courses on O&M of biogas plants and CSAWMP for participants to manage livestock and wastes
1.3.1a	a) Training on CSAWMP:	Ongoing	<i>Quarter 1-2017</i> : there are 580 people have been trained on CSAWMP, and none of them are ethnic minorities.

No.	Activities	Status	Achievements
			<u>Cumulative data as of Quarter 1-2017:</u> 8,397 people of the 10 provinces have been trained on CSAWMP, of which 1,220 are ethnic minorities, accounting for 14.53%. <u>Considering the 5 provinces with EMs only (no EM in Ha Tinh and Binh Dinh province),</u> the number of trained EM accounts for 22.8% (1,220/5,355)
1.3.2 (b)	Ethnic minority people trained on the use of small biogas plants	Ongoing	<u>Quarter 1-2017.</u> There have been training activities in Lào Cai and Bắc Giang provinces the operation of SBPs for 296 people, including 120 EMs. The other 5 provinces with EMs have not provided training for the EMs. The number of trained EMs are as follows:
			Lao Cai: 120/276= 43.48%
			Bac Giang: 0/20=0%
			The cumulative number of people trained on the operation of SBPs <i>as of Quarter 1-2017</i> is 46,690, including 2,820 EM people (accounting for 6%)
			Considering the 5 provinces with EMs, there are 34,122 trained, including 2,820 EM people (accounting for 8.2%).
1.3.2 (c)	Ethnic minority people trained on the operation at home (during the inspection and acceptance visits by technical staff)	Ongoing	<u>Quarter 1-2017,</u> 469 people have been trained on the operation of SBP at home, including 228 EM people (30%). The number of EM people received training at home by provinces are as follows:
			Lao Cai: 201 (201/302=66.56%)
			Soc Trang: 27 (27/167=16.2%)
			As of Quarter 1-2017, the cumulative number of people trained at home is: 36,153, including 2,122 EM people (accounting for 5.86%).
			<u>Considering the 5 provinces only,</u> the cumulative number as of Quarter 1-2017 is 26,153 people received training at home, including 2,315 EM people, and accounting for 9.2%.
1.3.3	Facilitate EM access to FIs	Ongoing	<u>Quarter 1-2017:</u> credit activities have been carried out in 3 provinces: 443 households have access to credit, including 172 EM households, accounting for 38%. Details are as follows:
			Lao Cai: 167/263=

No.	Activities	Status	Achievements
			Bac Giang: 5/129 Binh Dinh: 0/51 <i>As of Quarter 1-2017</i> , cumulative number of households who have access to credit is 729, including 268 EM households accounting for 36.8 %. No borrowers from other provinces
2	CSAWMP Technology Transfer		
2.1	CSAWMP Promotion		
2.1.1	Ensure EM areas included in agro-climatic mapping system	Ongoing	Ethnic minority areas are being input to the Project detailed agricultural climate map Currently, the map is being prepared under the Package 19 and the contract was signed on 11th April 2016
2.1.2	Disseminate CSAWMP knowledge explored from E-libraries to improve EM skill and knowledge.	Not yet done	TOR of the e-library package is being prepared for the design consultant
2.1.3	Ensure organic fertilizers are used in EM areas	Not yet done	
2.1.4	Ensure EMs are included in livestock waste management	Not yet done	
2.1.5	Encourage at least 30% of CSAWMP promotion participants among EMs are women.	Ongoing	<u>Quarter 1-2017: no activities.</u> <u>Cumulative data as of Quarter 1-2017:</u> The Project (including CPMU and 10 PPMUs) has trained 1,776 agriculture extension staff on CSAWMP, including 209 EM staff (11.8%). Among 209 EM extension staff, 75 are women, accounting for 35.9 % compared to the target of 30%. <u>Quarter 1-2017:</u> 3 provinces without EM people have trained 580 farmers on CSAWMP

No.	Activities	Status	Achievements
			<i>Cumulative data as of Quarter 1-2017</i> , 10 project provinces have trained 6,857 farmers on CSAWMP, including 1,037 EM people (accounting for 15.12%). Among 1,037 EM people, 340 are women, accounting for 32.79%.
2.2	<i>CSAWMP Models/ Technology Development Transfer</i>		
2.2.1	Ensure that researchers and extension workers trained to properly monitor and document CSAWMP progress in EMs.	Not yet due	
2.2.3	Disseminate CSAWMP skills and knowledge to EM, BP owners and other farmers in EM areas.	Ongoing	<i>Quarter 1-2017</i> : 7 provinces with EM people have not carried out this activity. <i>Cumulative data as of Quarter 1-2017</i> : 1,037 EM farmers have been trained on CSAWMP among the 7 provinces (accounting for 15.12% of the total number of the project)
2.3	<i>Biogas plant value chain model</i>		
2.3.1	Assess surplus of gas, electricity, bio-slurry for EMs	Not yet due	This activity will be provided in research packages
2.3.2	Manage gas, electricity and organic fertilizers for EMs	Ongoing	100% participant EMs are trained and guided for making full use of gas, electricity, and organic fertilizers from BP. Based on the result of baseline survey in 2016 and field visits of Environment Consultant of LIC, the project participants use bio-slurry as organic fertilizer for their garden and farm; compost the bio-slurry with other waste and residue; or share with other households. In regards of gas management, gas is used for cooking, heating water, heating stables, or shared with neighbors. In case of gas surplus, the BP owners burn it instead of release directly into environment <i>Cumulative data as of Quarter 1-2017</i> : 1,037 EM farmers have been trained on CSAWMP among the 5 provinces (accounting for 15.12% of the total number of the project)
3	Project Management		
3.1	Establish indicators to target EMs	Not yet	

No.	Activities	Status	Achievements
	in the province	due	
3.2	Ensure social safeguard staff include support for EMs in their work plan	Not yet due	
3.3	Ensure FIs to support EMs	Ongoing	<u>Quarter 1-2017:</u> The 2 FIs have provided loans for 443 households, including 172 EM households from the following 3 provinces:
			Lào Cai: 167/263
			Bac Giang: 5/129
			Binh Định: 0/51
<u>As of Quarter 1-2017,</u> cumulative number of households receiving loans is 268 (in total of 729 households), accounting for 37%.			

SUMMARY MAIN ACTIVITIES BY PROVINCE

No	Item	Lao Cai	Son La	Phu Tho	Bac Giang	Ha Tinh	Binh Dinh	Soc Trang	Nam Dinh	Tien Giang	Ben Tre	Total as of 31 March,2017
1	Total constructed SBPs	2,314	1,879	8,312	7,245	4,843	7,002	2,678	4,233	2,629	4,734	45,869
	Total constructed SBPs for EM	854	925	115	394	0	0	847				3,135
2	Dissemination activities (There is no specific activities for EMs)											
	Dissemination workshops	66	131	38	89		11	6	58	22	10	431
	TV programs	7	3	0	5	10	38	6	10	10	12	101
	Radio programs (in ethnic languages also):	21	12	44		262	544	1,080	540	1,915	18	4,436
	Articles on newspapers				50		51		22			123
	Leaflets;	10,000	15,000	20,000	7,000	10,000	10,000	25,000	10,000	20,000	3,000	130,000
	Information boards				150	262	4,000	15	204	10		4,641
	Posters;		5,000	3,000				7,500			4,000	19,500
	Video clip			6	10		1	6	2			25
	Banner										200	200
	Hand book						100					100
3	Training course on BP operation and CSAWMP for participants to manage their livestock and wastes	555	360	845	937	632	1,021	1,005	1,819	1,074	322	8,570
	Training course on BP operation and CSAWMP for EM	330	316		47			527				1,220

No	Item	Lao Cai	Son La	Phu Tho	Bac Giang	Ha Tinh	Binh Dinh	Soc Trang	Nam Dinh	Tien Giang	Ben Tre	Total as of 31 March.2017
4	ToT for extension staffs on CSAWMP	18	212	0	37	599	352		0	0	322	1,776
	ToT for EM extension staffs on CSAWMP	2	180		1	0	0					183
5	2 FIs provide credit participants	400	0	0	238	0	91	0	0	0	0	729
	2 FIs provide credit participants for EM	258	0	0	10	0	0	0		0	0	268

Appendix 7:

UPDATED GENDER ACTION PLAN (GAP) MONITORING TABLE

Project: Loan 2968-VIE : Low Carbon Agricultural Support Project

Project Mission leader: Sanath Ranawana

Date of update: 5 May 2017

Project Outputs	Proposed targets /actions	Progress [accumulated to date]	Issues/Challenge during implementation/ Recommendations
1.Expanded livestock waste management infrastructure	1• At least 20% of those who are trained in biogas management and technical issues are women.	• On-going: 34 training courses were conducted for technical staff in biogas management and technical issues. Among 1,180 participants, of which 277 female participants (23.5%).	- PPMUs are conscious and makes effort to train more female in technical workers more in the future (Lao Cai (LC),Tien Giang (TG), Soc Trang (ST), Binh Dinh (BD))
	2• At least 50% of trainees on biogas use will be women.	• On-going: ,1,682 training courses on utilization of biogas technology and operation and maintenance with 46,716 participants (including 16,443 female participants) and 36,161 peoples (including 24,164 female participants) were trained at-home. Total of participants is 82,877 including 40,607 female participants (49%) ¹	Targeted Trainees are the one in household members that registered to receive project subsidies support.=> PPMU actively target women members in household to register receiving the project subsidies and get direct training .

¹ Mr Lam Soay, Ms. Trieu Thi Kum Mang and Ms. Trinh Thi Thu Van (Bo Lien 2 village, Thuan Hung commune, My Tu district, Soc Trang province), these households were supported 3 million VND to construct SBP and participated in the training on biogas use and waste management in the commune and at home. According to them, before the construction of biogas plants, the environment in this area is very polluted, because the wastes of cows directly discharged into the canals. But since the construction of this biogas plant , the environment in here is much better and they use gas for cooking and save money on gas purchase . Mrs. Kum Mang borrowed 9 million VND from Vietnam Bank for Social Policies and paid interest with 90,000 VND /month.

Project Outputs	Proposed targets /actions	Progress [accumulated to date]	Issues/Challenge during implementation/ Recommendations
	<p>3• At least 20% of trainees on SBP construction issues will be women. (Adjusted 7% in MTR mission)</p>	<p>• On-going: 14 training courses on construction of small Biogas Plants, among 375 participants, of which 19 were women (5%).</p>	<p>- Mason of Biogas Plants (BP) are usually professional and skillful masons and get further training on BPs, it is a high skilled jobs but not a full time job so it is difficult for women to get trained and become masons. - TG,BD and Son La (SL): no female trainees on SBP constructions) ->PPMUs in province that managed to train female mason to recruit more actively and train more female masons</p>
	<p>4• At least 30% of trained employees in MBPs and LBPs are women. (Adjusted 15% in MTR mission)</p>	<p>• On-going: 2 training courses in MBPs and LBPs were conducted for 38 engineers and representative from 10 contractors with 4 women included (10.5%)</p>	<p>Few female technical staff ,so technical training faces difficulty ensuring female participation</p>

Project Outputs	Proposed targets /actions	Progress [accumulated to date]	Issues/Challenge during implementation/ Recommendations
2.Credit lines for biogas value chains	5.At least 50% of credit recipients will be registered under husband-wife joint accounts or on behalf of women.	• On-going: There are 341 credit recipients, of which 90 are registered under husband-wife joint accounts or on behalf of women (26.4%).	The target can be achievable if the project also target women as official register of receiving subsidies and credit at the same time.
	6• Official registration of all the purchased biogas units and plants under the project will be assisted. At least 50% of such will be under husband-wife joint accounts or on behalf of women	• On-going: There are 341 credit recipients, of which 90 are registered under women, (26.4%). -	.
3.Enhanced CSAWMP technology transfer	7• Gender sensitive research strategy prepared.	• Not yet done	The research strategy is elaborated by 2017 The Gender Specialist need to work with CPMU, PPMU and contractors to integrate gender issues into specific activities of the research

Project Outputs	Proposed targets /actions	Progress [accumulated to date]	Issues/Challenge during implementation/ Recommendations
	8. Training materials of CSAWMP technology and methodology of dissemination are women friendly (avoiding gender stereo types and using appropriate illustrations).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achieved: The Training materials of CSAWMP technology using pictures and appropriate illustrations, so women can easily understand and apply into practice². 	
	9• At least 50% of dissemination events and consultation will involve women-only groups (e.g.event will be carried out through commune women union's meetings). Adjusted 30% in MTR mission	<p>On-going: 431 dissemination meetings and workshops have been organized, of which 4 meetings and workshops are for women only (1%). (Lào Cai: 4/66 = 6%)</p>	Consultation with women only group to be conducted=> PPMU conduct dissemination events and consultation meeting with women's only group through local women union' meeting to inform about the project and CSAWMP technology.

² Ms. Le Thi Chung – Y Son commune (Ha Hoa district, Phu Tho province) attended 2 training courses (biogas use and farm management and waste management on farm) and Ms. Vu Thi Lien – Nghia Tan commune (Nghia Hung district, Nam Dinh province) attended training courses on biogas use , they said that training material was very well presentation and easy to follow.

Project Outputs	Proposed targets /actions	Progress [accumulated to date]	Issues/Challenge during implementation/ Recommendations
	<p>10• 30% of research project topics (21 project research topics) relate to gender issues/dimensions of biogas plants such as improved cooking stove, improved or household water heating system, women friendly post harvest processing tools/equipment that use biogas fuel.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • .Not yet done 	<p>CSAWMP research strategy developed and adaptive research on 6 CSAWMP topics are being procured, the list of 6 project research topics are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Package 25 (Research on organic fertilizer production from livestock waste and bio slurry by value chain): the shortlist and RFP submitted to ADB - Package 26 (Research on biogas technology improvement and effective biogas utilization by value chain): the shortlist and RFP submitted to MARD - Package 27 (Research on the water-saving pig farming technology) and - Package 28 (Research on effective utilization of crop waste by value chains): RFP submitted to MARD - Package 29 (Research on the treatment of sludge sediment in shrimp farming) and - Package 30 (Research on the cultivation techniques for GHG emission reduction)
	<p>11• Women account for at least 50% of those who are trained on farm management and waste management on farms. (Moved from Output 1 to output 3)</p>	<p>•On-going: 3,564 /7,030 female farmers (50.7%) participated in the training courses on farm management and waste management on farms.</p>	

Project Outputs	Proposed targets /actions	Progress [accumulated to date]	Issues/Challenge during implementation/ Recommendations
	<p>12• Select and train at least 40% women as champions of smart-agriculture in research and dissemination of CSAWMP technology. Adjusted 30% in MTR mission</p>	<p>On-going: The Project have organized training courses (TOT) for 1,776 extension staff, of which 612 are women, accounting for 34.5%;</p>	
	<p>13• Ensure legal (e.g., employment contract) and remuneration support for champions.</p>	<p>On-going: All extension staffs participated in TOT training courses have been supported per diem and delivered the certificate.</p>	
<p>4.Effective project management</p>	<p>14. 30% of personnel in participating institutions trained in O&M of research equipment are women.</p> <p>15. Project management support: CPMU and each PPMU will have a focal point/person for gender and ethnic minority issues.</p>	<p>• Not yet done</p> <p>• Achieved: CPMU and each PPMU assigned a focal point for gender and ethnic minority issues. The gender focal point was appointed in 2016. (11 focal point staff for gender : 01 staff of CPMU and 10 staff of 10 provinces)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - CPMU has submitted bidding document for package 14 and obtained approval by ADB. The Package 14 is being submitted to the GoV of Vietnam. - CPMU and gender specialist need to work with the contractors to integrate the indicator of 30% of personnel in participating institutions trained in O&M of research equipment are women

Project Outputs	Proposed targets /actions	Progress [accumulated to date]	Issues/Challenge during implementation/ Recommendations
	<p>16. Gender sensitivity workshops: at provincial, district, and commune levels will be carried out for all project staff, contractors, agricultural extension and veterinary staff and participating association steering committee as part of the project orientation.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • On-going: 3 training courses on raising gender awareness and ethnic minority were conducted in Can Tho, Binh Dinh and Thai Nguyen for project staff and stakeholders . Of a total 142 participants , 97 were females (68%) 	<p>Majority of participants are from Women Union which has little role in this project. => Briefing on Gender and GAP targets for focal points and PPMU key staff (coordinators, training officer, M&E officer, project director/vice director) to support implementation.</p>
	<p>17• Develop and update sex-disaggregated and ethnic minority data as part of project M&E and reporting system.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • On-going: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) M&E Consultant has developed the M&E system and templates for sex-disaggregated and ethnicity data collection. (ii) A database of biogas plants was transferred into a database monitoring software and will be updated as biogas construction progress with sex-disaggregated data. 	
	<p>18• 30% of CPMU and PPMU staff are women.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achieved: A CPMU and 10 PPMUs established in second quarter of 2013. As of March 2017, 55 out of 124 staff are women, (44.4%). 	